

Item No: 3
Case No: 17/01769/LIS
Proposal Description: Demolition of existing privy block and erection of new two storey restaurant extension
Address: 20-21 The Square Winchester SO23 9EX
Parish, or Ward if within Winchester City: St Michael
Applicants Name: Mr Simon Bridbury
Case Officer: Mrs Katie Nethersole
Date Valid: 6 July 2017
Site Factors: Winchester Conservation Area

Article 4 Direction
Civil Aviation
CIL Zones for Winchester City Council
Conservation Area
Southern Water Operational Area
Recommendation: Application Refused

General Comments

Councillor Tait's request for application to be determined by Planning Committee, see Appendix 1

Previous applications 13/02597/FUL and 13/02598/LIS Demolition of existing privy block and erection of two storey restaurant extension have been refused due to the size, bulk and form of the proposed extension being considered to harm the setting of the surrounding listed buildings.

There is an associated full application under reference 17/01768/FUL currently being considered alongside this application.

Site Description

The site is located within the city centre of Winchester and is situated on the east side of The Square which is part of the pedestrianised part of town. It is an unlisted building within the Winchester Conservation Area. The building itself is a three storey terraced building with a courtyard area to the rear which currently houses an historic privy block no longer in use. There are surrounding listed buildings including the adjacent properties including The Eclipse Public House (no. 24) which adjoins the courtyard to the south.

Proposal

It is proposed to demolish the existing privy block and construct a two storey rear extension to provide additional seating space. The extension is proposed to be constructed in glazing with render and a fully glazed roof. The width of the proposed extension will ensure that there is approximately 1.2 metres between the extension and the adjacent buildings which will ensure that the existing open passage along the rear of no. 24 (The Eclipse PH) will be retained. The overall height of the extension to ridge will be approximately 6 metres and to eaves will be approximately 4.8 metres.

Relevant Planning History

13/02597/FUL - Demolition of existing privy block and erection of two storey restaurant extension. REF 10th February 2014.

13/02598/LIS - Demolition of existing privy block and erection of two storey restaurant extension. REF 10th February 2014.

14/01534/FUL - Demolition of existing privy block and erection of single storey extension (RESUBMISSION). WDN 27th August 2014.

14/01535/LIS - Demolition of existing privy block and erection of single storey extension. WDN 27th August 2014.

14/02027/FUL - Demolition of existing privy block and the erection of a new single storey restaurant extension (AFFECTS THE SETTING OF A LISTED BUILDING). PER 19th December 2014.

14/02028/LIS - Demolition of existing privy block and the erection of a new single storey restaurant extension (AFFECTS THE SETTING OF A LISTED BUILDING). PER 19th December 2014.

17/01437/FUL - Demolition of existing privy block and erection of new single storey restaurant extension. PER 2nd August 2017.

17/01438/LIS - Demolition of existing privy block and erection of new single storey restaurant extension. PER 2nd August 2017.

Consultations

Archaeology: No objections subject to conditions

Head of Environmental Protection: A full acoustic report is required to assess the potential noise impact of the additional space created by the proposed extension.

Head of Historic Environment: Objects as it adversely affects listed buildings and the Conservation Area

City of Winchester Trust: Would prefer to see the single storey extension which would improve the area, unable to support a two storey extension

Representations:

No representations have been received on this application

Relevant Planning Policy:

Winchester Local Plan Part 1 – Joint Core Strategy
CP20

Winchester Local Plan Part 2 – Development Management and Site Allocations

DM27, DM28, DM29

National Planning Policy Guidance/Statements:

National Planning Policy Framework

Supplementary Planning Guidance

SPD – High Quality Places

Planning Considerations

Principle of development

The site is located within the settlement boundary of Winchester where the presumption is in favour of new development provided it complies with the relevant policies.

Policy CP20 seeks to ensure that the historic environment is conserved and enhanced. Heritage assets and their settings should be protected and enhanced by new development.

Policy DM7 sets out that town centres should consist of use classes A1 – A5, B1, C1, D1 and D2.

Policy DM27 allows for new development within Conservation Areas provided that it responds positively to the historic settlement pattern, views, townscape etc. Extensions should respect the character, scale; massing and plan form of the original building and should not dominate principal elevations.

Policy DM28 allows demolition within Conservation Areas provided the building or structure makes no positive contribution to the character and appearance of the area. The principle of demolishing the existing privy block has already been accepted in the previous approvals for the single storey extension.

Policy DM29 seeks to ensure that new development retains the historic plan form and structural integrity of the building. New development should reinforce the intrinsic nature of the building through the use of appropriate materials and details.

Design/layout

The proposed two storey extension is to occupy the courtyard area to the rear of the existing building and will create additional dining space for any future occupiers of the restaurant. The extension will provide enough space for a total seating capacity of around 100 which is an increase of about 54 covers. The design is contemporary in nature with it largely being constructed in glazing. This type of design is proposed to maintain the visibility of the historic surroundings. It is also proposed to enclose the escape stairs within the extension itself.

It is acknowledged that the revised design elements relating to the bin storage area and fire escape are an improvement. The proposal includes the replacement of the unsightly steel escape stair with an enclosed staircase of a safer design. However it is considered that the overall size, bulk and height of the proposed extension will have an adverse impact both on the surrounding listed buildings and the Conservation Area.

Impact on character of Conservation Area and listed buildings

The rear courtyard is in need of improvement which would benefit the setting of the sides and rears of the surrounding listed buildings. The principle of creating an enclosed

restaurant space is supported however it is considered that the proposed shallow pitch roof is extensive and overbearing which will preclude views to the historic roofs of surrounding listed buildings.

The double height proposal overall presents a bulk, albeit in glass to the top floor, which disguises the sense of enclosure that the surrounding listed buildings give. The eaves height is higher than the two storey eaves height of the listed building at no. 19 The Square. The diminutive size of the rear of The Eclipse would not be appreciated due to the size and the bulk of the proposed extension.

Planning Policy and guidance set out in the High Quality Places set out that rear extensions should be subordinate to the host building. However this proposal is infilling of a courtyard space which affects 5 neighbouring listed buildings and is not considered to be subordinate against the small scale of these surrounding buildings. The proposed extension is considered to fill the rear courtyard space too extensively. It is considered that the roof shape is awkward as the building is being designed from the inside out rather than the elegance of the pyramidal roof shape of the permitted single storey extension.

The character of the Walled Town part of the Winchester Conservation Area is of buildings clustered tightly together, many conform to the burgage plots and rear yards surrounded by buildings. Many of these spaces have been developed over the centuries and whilst this proposal fills in an historic space the permitted extension is of a form that is lightweight and relatively benign allowing shoppers at Rohan, no. 24 The Square (Grade II* listed) to see straight out onto this roof from the first floor windows. This two storey proposal will blur and distract from the views of historic roofs and the church tower.

It is considered that the larger size and bulk of the two storey proposal does not address the reasons for refusal on the previous two storey proposal (13/02597/FUL and 13/02598/LIS) and therefore this current proposal cannot be supported.

Economic viability factors have dictated that the scheme is only possible if there is a two storey extension to provide more dining space. From the setting of the listed buildings viewpoint the concern is to better reveal listed buildings, enhance their settings and preserve the character of the Conservation Area. It is therefore considered that these viability factors do not outweigh the impact that the proposal will have on the listed buildings and Conservation Area.

Viability

In support of the application a viability report has been submitted to explain why the proposed two storey scheme is more viable than the consented single storey extension. This statement explains that the additional capacity as a result of the proposed two storey extension would result in a more attractive premise to restaurant operators and therefore is more likely to resolve the long standing neglect of the premises. The previous lessees of the premises closed the business as the limited capacity rendered it unviable in the present market. However it is considered that this justification does not outweigh the concerns raised by the Historic Environment Officer in terms of its impact on the Conservation Area and Listed buildings.

Recommendation

Application Refused for the following reasons:

Reasons

01 The proposed development would adversely affect the character of the Walled Town section of the Winchester Conservation Area by reason of its large scale and height, infilling an historic space contrary to policy CP20 of the Winchester District Local Plan Part 1 - Joint Core Strategy and policies DM27, DM28 and DM29 of the Winchester District Local Plan Part 2 - Development Management and Site Allocations

02 The proposed development by reason of its large scale, bulk, height and form would harm the setting of the surrounding buildings which are listed as being of architectural or historic interest contrary to policy CP20 of the Winchester District Local Plan Part 1 - Joint Core Strategy and policies DM27, DM28 and DM29 of the Winchester District Local Plan Part 2 - Development Management and Site Allocations

Informatives:

In accordance with paragraphs 186 and 187 of the NPPF Winchester City Council (WCC) take a positive and proactive approach to development proposals focused on solutions. WCC work with applicants/agents in a positive and proactive manner by; offering a pre-application advice service, updating applicants/agents of any issues that may arise in the processing of their application and where possible suggesting solutions. The applicant was updated of any issues after the initial site visit.

The Local Planning Authority has taken account of the following development plan policies and proposals:-

Winchester District Local Plan Part 1 - Joint Core Strategy: Policy CP20
Winchester District Local Plan Part 2 - Development Management and Site Allocations:
DM27, DM28 and DM29
SPD - High Quality Places

Appendix 1

City Councillor's request that a Planning Application be considered by Planning Development Control Committee

Request from Councillor Tait
Case Number:17/01768/FUL and associated 17/01769/LIS
Site Address: 20-21 The Square, Winchester, SO23 9EX
Proposal Description: Demolition of existing privy and erection of new two storey restaurant extension
Requests that the item be considered by the Planning Development Control Committee for the following material planning reasons:
Whilst views of the proposed two storey extension are limited, I believe

that members may be able to add significant value in determining whether the proposals conserve and enhance the conservation area. Also whether the proposed shallow pitch roof is too extensive and overbearing.

Once completed, please email this form to the relevant Planning Case Officer and the Head of Planning Management.

Item No: 4
Case No: 17/01768/FUL
Proposal Description: Demolition of existing privy block and erection of new two storey restaurant extension
Address: 20-21 The Square Winchester SO23 9EX
Parish, or Ward if within Winchester City: St Michael
Applicants Name: Mr Simon Bridbury
Case Officer: Mrs Katie Nethersole
Date Valid: 7 July 2017
Site Factors: Winchester Conservation Area

Article 4 Direction
Civil Aviation
CIL Zones for Winchester City Council
Conservation Area
Southern Water Operational Area
Recommendation: Application Refused

General Comments

Councillor Tait request for application to be determined by Planning Committee, see Appendix 1

Previous applications 13/02597/FUL and 13/02598/LIS Demolition of existing privy block and erection of two storey restaurant extension have been refused due to the size, bulk and form of the proposed extension being considered to harm the setting of the surrounding listed buildings.

There is an associated listed building application under reference 17/01769/LIS currently being considered alongside this application.

Site Description

The site is located within the city centre of Winchester and is situated on the east side of The Square which is part of the pedestrianised part of town. It is an unlisted building within the Winchester Conservation Area. The building itself is a three storey terraced building with a courtyard area to the rear which currently houses an historic privy block no longer in use. There are surrounding listed buildings including the adjacent properties including The Eclipse Public House (no. 24) which adjoins the courtyard to the south.

Proposal

It is proposed to demolish the existing privy block and construct a two storey rear extension to provide additional seating space. The extension is proposed to be constructed in glazing with render and a fully glazed roof. The width of the proposed extension will ensure that there is approximately 1.2 metres between the extension and the adjacent buildings which will ensure that the existing open passage along the rear of no. 24 (The Eclipse PH) will be retained. The overall height of the extension to ridge will be approximately 6 metres and to eaves will be approximately 4.8 metres.

Relevant Planning History

13/02597/FUL - Demolition of existing privy block and erection of two storey restaurant extension. REF 10th February 2014.

13/02598/LIS - Demolition of existing privy block and erection of two storey restaurant extension. REF 10th February 2014.

14/01534/FUL - Demolition of existing privy block and erection of single storey extension (RESUBMISSION). WDN 27th August 2014.

14/01535/LIS - Demolition of existing privy block and erection of single storey extension. WDN 27th August 2014.

14/02027/FUL - Demolition of existing privy block and the erection of a new single storey restaurant extension (AFFECTS THE SETTING OF A LISTED BUILDING). PER 19th December 2014.

14/02028/LIS - Demolition of existing privy block and the erection of a new single storey restaurant extension (AFFECTS THE SETTING OF A LISTED BUILDING). PER 19th December 2014.

17/01437/FUL - Demolition of existing privy block and erection of new single storey restaurant extension. PER 2nd August 2017.

17/01438/LIS - Demolition of existing privy block and erection of new single storey restaurant extension. PER 2nd August 2017.

Consultations

Archaeology: No objections subject to conditions

Head of Environmental Protection: A full acoustic report is required to assess the potential noise impact of the additional space created by the proposed extension.

Head of Historic Environment: Objects as it adversely affects listed buildings and the Conservation Area.

City of Winchester Trust: Would prefer to see the single storey extension which would improve the area, unable to support a two storey extension

Representations:

No representations were received on this application.

Relevant Planning Policy:

Winchester Local Plan Part 1 – Joint Core Strategy

WT1, CP13, CP20

Winchester Local Plan Part 2 – Development Management and Site Allocations

DM27, DM28, DM29

National Planning Policy Guidance/Statements:
National Planning Policy Framework

Supplementary Planning Guidance
SPD – High Quality Places

Planning Considerations

Principle of development

The site is located within the settlement boundary of Winchester where the presumption is in favour of new development provided it complies with the relevant policies.

Policy CP20 seeks to ensure that the historic environment is conserved and enhanced. Heritage assets and their settings should be protected and enhanced by new development.

Policy DM7 sets out that town centres should consist of use classes A1 – A5, B1, C1, D1 and D2.

Policy DM27 allows for new development within Conservation Areas provided that it responds positively to the historic settlement pattern, views, townscape etc. Extensions should respect the character, scale; massing and plan form of the original building and should not dominate principal elevations.

Policy DM28 allows demolition within Conservation Areas provided the building or structure makes no positive contribution to the character and appearance of the area. The principle of demolishing the existing privy block has already been accepted in the previous approvals for the single storey extension.

Policy DM29 seeks to ensure that new development retains the historic plan form and structural integrity of the building. New development should reinforce the intrinsic nature of the building through the use of appropriate materials and details.

Design/layout

The proposed two storey extension is to occupy the courtyard area to the rear of the existing building and will create additional dining space for any future occupiers of the restaurant. The extension will provide enough space for a total seating capacity of around 100 which is an increase of about 54 covers. The design is contemporary in nature with it largely being constructed in glazing. This type of design is proposed to maintain the visibility of the historic surroundings. It is also proposed to enclose the escape stairs within the extension itself.

It is acknowledged that the revised design elements relating to the bin storage area and fire escape are an improvement. However it is considered that the overall size, bulk and height of the proposed extension will have an adverse impact both on the surrounding listed buildings and the Conservation Area.

Impact on character of area

The rear courtyard is in need of improvement which would benefit the setting of the sides and rears of the surrounding listed buildings. The principle of creating an enclosed restaurant space is supported however it is considered that the proposed shallow pitch roof is extensive and overbearing which will preclude views to the historic roofs of

surrounding listed buildings.

The double height proposal overall presents a bulk, albeit in glass to the top floor, which disguises the sense of enclosure that the surrounding listed buildings give. The eaves height is higher than the two storey eaves height of the listed building at no. 19 The Square. The diminutive size of the rear of The Eclipse would not be appreciated due to the size and the bulk of the proposed extension.

Planning Policy and guidance set out in the High Quality Places set out that rear extensions should be subordinate to the host building. However this proposal is infilling of a courtyard space which affects 5 neighbouring listed buildings and is not considered to be subordinate against the small scale of these surrounding buildings. The proposed extension is considered to fill the rear courtyard space too extensively. It is considered that the roof shape is awkward as the building is being designed from the inside out rather than the elegance of the pyramidal roof shape of the permitted single storey extension.

The character of the Walled Town part of the Winchester Conservation Area is of buildings clustered tightly together, many conform to the burgage plots and rear yards surrounded by buildings. Many of these spaces have been developed over the centuries and whilst this proposal fills in an historic space the permitted extension is of a form that is lightweight and relatively benign allowing shoppers at Rohan, no. 24 The Square (Grade II* listed) to see straight out onto this roof from the first floor windows. This two storey proposal will blur and distract from the views of historic roofs and the church tower.

It is considered that the larger size and bulk of the two storey proposal does not address the reasons for refusal on the previous two storey proposal (13/02597/FUL and 13/02598/LIS) and therefore this current proposal cannot be supported.

Economic viability factors have dictated that the scheme is only possible if there is a two storey extension to provide more dining space. From the setting of the listed buildings viewpoint the concern is to better reveal listed buildings, enhance their settings and preserve the character of the Conservation Area. It is therefore considered that these viability factors do not outweigh the impact that the proposal will have on the listed buildings and Conservation Area.

Viability

In support of the application a viability report has been submitted to explain why the proposed two storey scheme is more viable than the consented single storey extension. This statement explains that the additional capacity as a result of the proposed two storey extension would result in a more attractive premise to restaurant operators and therefore is more likely to resolve the long standing neglect of the premises. The previous lessees of the premises closed the business as the limited capacity rendered it unviable in the present market. However it is considered that this justification does not outweigh the concerns raised by the Historic Environment Officer in terms of its impact on the Conservation Area and Listed buildings.

Environmental Protection

There is concern about the potential for noise disturbance to nearby residents from the premises. No details have been supplied by the applicant regarding this and the Environmental Protection Officer has advised that a full acoustic report should be

submitted. The applicant has been advised of this but has not submitted a report because the application is recommended for refusal.

Impact on neighbouring amenities

The nearest residential properties are to the upper floors of The Eclipse PH (25 The Square) which is to the rear but at an angle so are not considered to be adversely affected by the proposal. There is concern that there is potential for noise disturbance from the premises and this is discussed in the section above.

Recommendation

Application Refused for the following reasons:

Reasons

- 01 The proposed development would adversely affect the character of the Walled Town section of the Winchester Conservation Area by reason of its large scale and height, infilling an historic space contrary to policy CP20 of the Winchester District Local Plan Part 1 - Joint Core Strategy and policies DM27, DM28 and DM29 of the Winchester District Local Plan Part 2 - Development Management and Site Allocations
- 02 The proposed development by reason of its large scale, bulk, height and form would harm the setting of the surrounding buildings which are listed as being of architectural or historic interest contrary to policy CP20 of the Winchester District Local Plan Part 1 – Joint Core Strategy and policies DM27, DM28 and DM29 of the Winchester District Local Plan Part 2 – Development Management and Site Allocations

Informatives:

In accordance with paragraphs 186 and 187 of the NPPF Winchester City Council (WCC) take a positive and proactive approach to development proposals focused on solutions. WCC work with applicants/agents in a positive and proactive manner by; offering a pre-application advice service, updating applicants/agents of any issues that may arise in the processing of their application and where possible suggesting solutions. The applicant was updated of any issues after the initial site visit.

The Local Planning Authority has taken account of the following development plan policies and proposals:-

Winchester District Local Plan Part 1 - Joint Core Strategy: Policy CP20

Winchester District Local Plan Part 2 - Development Management and Site Allocations:

DM27, DM28 and DM29

SPD - High Quality Places

Appendix 1

City Councillor's request that a Planning Application be considered by Planning Development Control Committee

Request from Councillor Tait
Case Number:17/01768/FUL and associated 17/01769/LIS
Site Address: 20-21 The Square, Winchester, SO23 9EX
Proposal Description: Demolition of existing privy and erection of new two storey restaurant extension
Requests that the item be considered by the Planning Development Control Committee for the following material planning reasons: Whilst views of the proposed two storey extension are limited, I believe that members may be able to add significant value in determining whether the proposals conserve and enhance the conservation area. Also whether the proposed shallow pitch roof is too extensive and overbearing.

Once completed, please email this form to the relevant Planning Case Officer and the Head of Planning Management.