

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

Winchester City
Council
Planning Department
Development Control

TEAM MANAGER
SIGN OFF SHEET

Committee Decision

Case No:	06/01835/FUL	Valid Date	16 May 2006
W No:	06907/04	Recommendation Date	22 August 2006
Case Officer:	Mr Michael Wright	8 Week Date	11 July 2006
		05 October	
Recommendation:	Application Permitted	Decision:	Committee Decision

Proposal:	Demolition of existing house and construction of 2 no. detached houses and 2 no semi-detached houses with associated garaging, parking and turning areas (Resubmission)
------------------	---

Site:	Martins Close Compton Street Compton Winchester Hampshire
--------------	---

Open Space Y/N	Legal Agreement	S.O.S	Objections	EIA Development	Monitoring Code	Previous Developed Land
	Y/N	Y/N	Y/N	Y/N	Y/N	Y/N

DELEGATED ITEM SIGN OFF		
APPROVE Subject to the condition(s) listed	REFUSE for the reason(s) listed	
	Signature	Date
CASE OFFICER		
TEAM MANAGER		

AMENDED PLANS DATE:- 12 JUNE 2006-08-30

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

Item No: ITEM 07
Case No: 06/01835/FUL / W06907/04
Proposal Description: Demolition of existing house and construction of 2 no. detached houses and 2 no semi-detached houses with associated garaging, parking and turning areas (Resubmission)
Address: Martins Close Compton Street Compton Winchester Hampshire
Parish/Ward: Compton And Shawford
Applicants Name: Andbury Properties Ltd
Case Officer: Mr Michael Wright
Date Valid: 16 May 2006
Site Factors: Compton Street Conservation Area
Civil Aviation
Conservation Area
Recommendation: Application Permitted

General Comments

This application, which represents a resubmission following a first refusal, is reported to Committee at the request of Compton & Shawford Parish Council, whose request is appended in full to this report, as well as due to the number of objections received. The revised scheme retains the same number of residential units but with a substantial change in design to make it more compatible with the surrounding area. Broadly the current design concept moves away from a suburban layout to that of a courtyard of buildings to form an interconnected group which are designed to appear as subservient outbuildings to the main house.

The application has been the subject of amended plans submitted in June. The main alterations to the originally submitted plans relate to the details of the dormer on the west elevation and the window designs on the north elevation of house H2.

The application follows three previous submissions. The first application was granted planning consent in 2005 for the demolition of the existing dwelling and the erection of three dwellings comprising a large 5 bedroom dwelling and two smaller two bedroom dwellings. Conservation Area consent was granted at the same time for the demolition of the existing house.

Following a change of ownership a further application was made in 2005 for the demolition of the existing dwelling and the erection of four detached dwellings, comprising two 5 bedroom houses and two 2 bedroom houses. This application was refused for a number of reasons, primarily with concern about an over intensive development with the number, position and design of the houses not preserving the character of the Compton Street Conservation Area. It was considered that the proposal would result in a cramped housing layout out of keeping with the character of the locality and detrimental to the visual amenity of the surroundings. A further reason for the refusal was the failure to make adequate provision for public recreational open space to the required standard and therefore detrimental to the amenities of the area.

Site Description

Martins Close is a large detached 1920's property set in a large landscaped garden with a number of outbuildings to the north east. The plot extends to approximately 0.51 hectares. The area is characterised by a mix of housing type, style, size and design but properties are generally large and set in substantial grounds and the majority are built close to the frontage of the lane except for 'Martins Close' and its neighbour 'Old Orchard', which are set back from the street frontage. Opposite Martins Close is an attractive listed period cottage set in substantial landscaped gardens. Further along Compton Street, at Godwins Field, properties are built at a higher density with smaller garden areas.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

Compton is a linear village that lies on an ancient east/west route known as Compton Street. The land rises gently from Compton Street to the south and is bordered by mature trees and hedgerow. The street is rural in character, the lane narrowing towards the end and leading to Cox Croft Farm. It is not a through route. The boundaries of the street are made up of mature trees and hedgerows which are the most important features of the Conservation Area. To the north is a substantial tree belt and open countryside beyond. Compton End across the road from the site is a Grade II* listed building with an Historic Garden on the English Heritage list of Historic Gardens.

To the east the property borders 'Old Orchard' with a mature yew hedge. This property is a single storey 1960's bungalow of contemporary design, set in mature gardens. The first floor side windows of 'Martins Close' look directly eastward into the front garden of 'Old Orchard'. To the west is Cox Croft Farm and its associated agricultural buildings with open countryside beyond. The boundary between 'Martins Close' and the farm is made up of mature trees and hedgerow. The open countryside to the west is designated as a strategic gap.

Proposal

The application seeks full planning permission to demolish the existing house and outbuildings at 'Martins Close' and the construction of 1 no. detached six bedroom house with double integral garage, 1 no. detached five bedroom house with double integral garage and 2 no. semi-detached two and one bedroom houses with associated parking bays. The intention is to form a courtyard of buildings to form an interconnected group which are designed to appear as subservient outbuildings to the main house.

The six bedroom house (H1) would have a similar footprint to the existing property plus outbuildings although at right angles to the existing and further removed from the east boundary. The garden for this house is located to the front and a large space to the rear. The five bedroom house (H2) would be forward of this house and closer to the east boundary. The garden space would be located to the rear. The 2 one and two bedroom semi-detached houses (H3 & H4) would be sited 2.6m from the east boundary and to the front of the property. The garden space would be located to the front and side of these properties.

The existing access and driveway would lead to the courtyard development. The existing boundary trees and hedges on the site would be retained and reinforced as part of the landscape scheme.

Relevant Planning History

W06907/01 Demolition of existing dwelling and replacement with 1 No detached five bedroom dwelling with detached double garage, 2 No detached two bedroom dwellings with integral single garage and access – Martins Close, Compton Street, Compton, Winchester - Application Permitted - 11/02/2005.

W06907/02LBCA Demolition of house – Martins Close Compton Street, Compton, Winchester - Application Permitted – 11/02/2005.

W06907/03 Demolition of existing house and erection of 2 No five bedroom detached houses and 2 No two bedroom detached houses with associated garaging, parking and turning areas – Martins Close, Compton Street, Compton, Winchester – Application Refused – 10/11/2005.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

Consultations

Conservation:

The application is the result of extensive consultation after the refusal of the previous application and is now largely acceptable due to a substantial change in design. Some of the details on the elevations require amendment, including the design of some of the dormer windows and transoms on the windows. If these minor reservations can be resolved then I consider that the proposal preserves if not enhances the character of the Conservation Area and is therefore in accord with policy.

Engineers: Highways:

The proposal will lead to only a small increase in traffic that is unlikely to cause demonstrable harm to users of the adjoining highway and therefore it will be difficult to sustain a highway reason for refusal at appeal. No objection subject to standard conditions.

Landscape:

The revised proposal pull the proposed dwellings away from the existing trees to be retained along the west, southern and northern boundaries and allows for the retention the foxglove tree (T62) and is an improvement in terms of impact on surrounding environment. There is still concern about houses H3 and H4 been very close to the eastern boundary and the proximity of the ground floor windows is likely to create an ongoing management issue. Ideally I would like to see these dwellings shifted forward slightly. The proposed hedge species will need to be carefully considered.

There is a large garden area incorporated as part of house H4 which includes a number of maturing trees likely to be costly in terms of future management. The developers may wish to consider delineating a smaller garden area for house H4 and either transferring the area close to the driveway to the main dwelling or setting up a management agreement to cover this area.

Recommend approval subject to landscape conditions.

Archaeology:

Proposed development has the potential to impact on previous unknown archaeological remains and planning consent should only be granted subject to a condition for a programme of archaeological monitoring and recording (watching brief) in mitigation of development.

Southern Water:

No adverse comment on the application.

Representations:

Compton & Shawford Parish Council

Objects to the application. Contrary to Criterion 1 of the Local Plan infilling policy due to distance and lack of footpath at the end of Compton Street resulting in lack of access to facilities and services; development would contribute further to the loss of the linear nature of Compton Street which is starting to erode due to the development of the Beechcroft development; Compton Street cannot accommodate further traffic due to intersection and visibility constraints.

Compton Village Association

Objects to the development. Resubmission is an over intensive form of development; the number, position and design of the proposed houses do not preserve or enhance the character of the Conservation area; Submitted proposals do not satisfy all the detailed criteria in the Local Plan Review Infilling Policy; neither local school nor public transport can be conveniently and safely accessed from the site which is unsustainable; Compton Street cannot accommodate additional

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

traffic; outside the envelope formed by existing buildings; fails to meet the other criteria of the Supplementary Planning Document; Close proximity to the canopy of existing trees; comprehensive traffic survey required to assess impact of additional traffic; damage caused by construction traffic to the mature trees, hedgerows and banks.

12 letters received objecting to the application for the following reasons:

- Harmful to the character of the Compton Street Conservation area including loss of trees and hedges and noise pollution.
- Insufficient road capacity for additional traffic in Compton Street.
- Neither local school nor public transport can be conveniently or safely accessed from the site on foot.
- Does not represent a major change from previous application which was refused.

Reasons aside not material to planning and therefore not addressed in this report

- Local school already full.

No letters of support received.

Relevant Planning Policy:

Hampshire County Structure Plan Review:

- UB1, UB3, H5, H7, R2, E8, E16, T2, T5 and T6.

Winchester District Local Plan

- DP1, DP3, DP4, DP5, CE23, HE1, HE4, HE5, HE6, HE7, HE8, H4, H7, RT4, T2 and T4.

Supplementary Planning Guidance:

- Implementation of Infilling Policy
- Achieving a Better Mix in New Housing Developments
- Winchester Housing Needs Survey
- Winchester District Urban Capacity Study
- Guide to the Open Space Funding System

National Planning Policy Guidance/Statements:

PPS 1 Delivering Sustainable Development

PPG 3 Housing

PPG 15 Planning and the historic environment

PPG 16 Archaeology and planning

Planning Considerations

Principle of development

'Martins Close' is located on land designated as countryside. The site falls under policy H4 which deals with new residential development in such areas in the adopted local plan review. All proposals for residential infill development will therefore be considered on their merits having regard to the relationship of the proposed site to the village or settlement, the impact on its character or that of the surrounding area and, in particular, to the sustainability of the village or settlement. The proposals are required to satisfy these criteria as further amplified in the 7 detailed criteria set out in the Supplementary Planning Document.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

In respect of criterion 1 it is considered that the application site is within viable walking distance of local facilities and services which include a primary school, parish church, public house, Shawford village hall and sub post office. There is also frequent bus transport to a wider range of facilities and services in Winchester, Chandlers Ford and Southampton. While there is no footway along the last section of the road to the application site it is still considered to be a safe route for pedestrians to traverse. This is due to the fact that it effectively operates as a shared surface with low vehicular speeds as the road is not a through route and has low traffic generation due to the small number of properties accessing the end of Compton Road.

In respect of Criterion 2 it is considered that the proposal is in compliance with both sub criteria in that it forms a limited gap between permanent established buildings, one of which is residential within an otherwise continuously built up frontage to an existing road, and the proposal is for the intensification by redevelopment of residential properties within a continuously built up frontage to an existing road.

In respect of Criterion 3 the highways department has raised no objections as safe access to the highway can be provided and the proposal will lead to only a small increase in traffic which is unlikely to cause demonstrable harm to users of the adjoining highway.

In respect of Criterion 4 Compton Street is one of the settlements identified in Annexe C of the Supplementary Planning Document and is therefore in compliance.

In respect of Criterion 5 the site is not within a Local or Strategic Gap as defined in the adopted Local Plan Review.

In respect of Criterion 6 it is considered that the proposal would not result in the loss of a break in the frontage or a natural feature which is of importance to the settlement as the affected portion of Compton Street will retain its mature, rural character.

In respect of Criterion 7 it is considered that the revised proposal respects and responds positively to the particular character of the locality following extensive discussions with the Council's planning, conservation and landscape officers after the first refusal and who now support the proposal. In particular the proposal balances the need to protect the character and appearance of the Conservation Area with the need to make a more efficient use of a large underused site.

In addition Countryside policy allows for replacement dwellings in the countryside provided that the redevelopment does not reduce the stock of affordable dwellings in the countryside subject to no increased visual intrusion. The guidance contained in Planning Policy Guidance Note 3, Housing, seeks to ensure that new development makes efficient use of land and encourages higher density housing. Policy H7 reiterates this advice and encourages a range of dwelling type and size on sites capable of accommodating 2 or more dwellings. 50% of housing on such plots must be 1 or 2 bedroom units.

The site is within the Compton Street Conservation Area where new buildings are permitted provided that they preserve or enhance the character of the area and do not generate excessive traffic, car parking or noise or other detriment to the local environment. Policy DP1 requires that all planning applications are supported by a design statement. Policy DP3 (amongst other criteria) seeks to ensure that new development makes efficient use of land, responds positively to the character appearance and variety of the local environment, does not have an unacceptable adverse impact on adjoining land uses or property and provides sufficient amenity space. Policies DP4 and DP5 seek to safeguard the District's landscape and maintain or enhance the visual and environmental character of the area.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

It is considered that the replacement of the existing house at 'Martins Close' and the construction of 2 no. detached houses and 2 no semi-detached houses with associated garaging, parking and turning areas accommodates these policy requirements and is acceptable in principle, subject to the consideration of the following:

- Design/layout
- Impact on character of Conservation Area
- Residential amenities
- Landscape/trees
- Highways/parking
- Private Amenity Space
- Drainage/flooding
- Comments on representations

Design/layout

The development has been designed to ensure a more efficient use of land with the introduction of two detached houses and two semi-detached houses which is in accordance with Government Guidance and Local Plan policy. The density of the redevelopment is however approximately 8 units per hectare which is significantly lower than the Government's minimum standard of 30 units per hectare in Planning Policy Guidance 3. Given the rural location and the need to preserve the character and appearance of the Conservation Area the lower density is considered acceptable.

The front elevation of the main detached house is of traditional neoclassical design to reflect the mixed character of the Conservation area. The gable front will be visible from the driveway to create a focal point. The intention is to form a courtyard of buildings to create an interconnected group which are designed to appear as subservient outbuildings to the main house. The existing access and driveway would lead to the courtyard development. The existing boundary trees and hedges on the site would be retained and reinforced as part of the landscape scheme. The design proposal reflects both national and local policy and is considered to be satisfactory.

Impact on character of Conservation Area

The six bedroom house (H1) would have a similar footprint to the existing property plus outbuildings although at right angles to the existing and further removed from the east boundary. The five bedroom house (H2) would be forward of this house and closer to the east boundary. Given that the boundary trees and hedgerows are to be retained it is considered that the detached houses will not cause any increased visual intrusion to the open countryside to the west and north of the site. The 2 one and two bedroom semi-detached houses (H3 & H4) would be sited close to the east boundary and to the front of the property and again will be screened from the wider area by the retention and improvement of existing planting.

The Conservation Officer is satisfied that the new buildings have been designed to accord with the local character and that they will preserve if not enhance the Conservation Area.

The loss of the existing house on the site was permitted on 11/02/2005 under Conservation Area Consent application W06907/02LBCA.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

Residential amenities

There are no first floor windows on the east elevations of the proposed detached house (H2). The proposed 2 semi-detached properties (H3 & H4) contain high level roof lights which will not cause material overlooking to nearby dwellings. It is therefore considered that there will be no loss of privacy to the occupants of 'Old Orchard'. The 2.6 metre gap between the east elevation and the common boundary with 'Old Orchard' will prevent unacceptable loss of light or an overbearing impact to the front garden area of the neighbouring property. Overall it is considered that the redevelopment of the site is considered to have a satisfactory impact on the amenities of the adjoining residents.

The new dwellings have been designed as a courtyard of buildings and there will be an element of mutual overlooking. The overlooking is not considered to be so harmful as to merit the refusal of the application, especially given the requirements for increased housing density and to ensure the retention of privacy enjoyed by existing residents.

Landscape/Trees

The Arboricultural officer is satisfied that the existing trees on the site can be adequately protected and thus retained. The Landscape Officer considers the revised proposal to be satisfactory in terms of landscape issues. A landscape scheme has been requested by way of Planning Condition to ensure that the additional hedge planting and retention of trees and hedges is implemented.

Highways/Parking

The Highways Engineer is satisfied that the proposal will only lead to a small increase in traffic and that it is unlikely to cause demonstrable harm to users of the adjoining highway and therefore it will be difficult to sustain a highway reason for refusal at appeal.

Private Amenity Space

The four new dwellings are considered to have adequate private amenity space in keeping with other properties along Compton Street.

Drainage/flooding

The drainage engineer is satisfied that the existing public foul sewer in Compton Street can be used and has advised that this must be used in preference to any other method for the disposal of foul water.

Representations

The report has sought to establish that the proposal is consistent with relevant policy. It is considered that the matters raised in objection have been dealt with adequately in the report and are not sufficiently robust to impede the granting of approval, subject to conditions.

Planning Obligations/Agreements

In seeking the planning obligation(s) and/or financial contributions for Public Open Space and Sports Provision, the Local Planning Authority has had regard to the tests laid down in Circular 05/2005

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

which requires the obligations to be necessary; relevant to planning; directly related to the proposed development; fairly and reasonably related in scale and kind to the proposed development and reasonable in all other respects.

Recommendation

APPROVE – subject to a Section 106 for:

1. A financial contribution of £4,990 towards the provision of public open space and sports provision through the open space funding system.

(Note: If the Legal Agreement is not completed within 6 months then the application may be refused without further reference to Committee)

Conditions

1 The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.

Reason: To comply with the provisions of Section 91 (1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended).

2 No development shall take place until details and samples of the materials to be used in the construction of the external surfaces of the buildings hereby permitted have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To ensure that the development presents a satisfactory appearance in the interests of the amenities of the area.

3 Full details of all new windows and doors shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of work. The windows and doors shall be installed in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To protect the character and appearance of the building (or conservation area).

4 All rainwater goods shall be of cast iron unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To protect the character and appearance of the (listed) building.

5 Development shall not begin until drainage works have been carried out in accordance with details to be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To ensure satisfactory provision of foul and surface water drainage.

6 Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995 (or any Order revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification) no development permitted by Class 1 of Parts A, B and C of Schedule 2 of the Order, shall be carried out without the prior written consent of the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To protect the amenities of the locality and to maintain a good quality environment.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

7 Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995, (or any order revoking and re-enacting that order, with or without modification), no windows other than those expressly authorised by this permission shall, at any time, be constructed in the east elevation(s) of the dwellings hereby permitted.

Reason: To protect the amenity and privacy of the adjoining residential properties.

8 All work relating to the development hereby approved, including works of demolition or preparation prior to operations, shall only take place between the hours of 8.00am Monday to Friday and 6.00pm Saturdays and at no time on Sundays and Bank Holidays, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To protect the amenities of adjoining properties during the construction period.

9 Before the development hereby approved is first brought into use, a turning space shall be provided within the site to enable vehicles using the site to enter and leave in a forward gear. The turning space shall be retained and kept available for such purposes at all times.

Reason: In the interests of highway safety.

10 The garage and parking spaces hereby approved shall not be used for any other purpose than the parking of cars.

Reason: To ensure the provision and retention of the n the interests of local amenity and highway safety.

11 The development hereby approved must be carried out in accordance with the amended plan numbers 575/p13 Rev. B; 575/p14 Rev. B.

Reason: To ensure the development is carried out in accordance with the amended plans.

12 No development shall take place until details of both hard and soft landscape works have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and these works shall be carried out as approved. These details shall include the following, as relevant:

12 - existing and proposed finished levels or contours:

12 - means of enclosure, including any retaining structures:

12 - hard surfacing materials:

12 - proposed and existing functional services above and below ground (e.g. drainage, power, communications cables, pipelines etc, including lines, manholes, supports etc.):

12 - retained historic landscape features and proposals for restoration.

12 Soft landscape details shall include the following as relevant:

12 - planting plans:

12 - written specifications (including cultivation and other operations associated with plant and grass establishment:

12 - schedules of plants, noting species, planting sizes and proposed numbers/densities where appropriate:

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

12 - implementation programme:

Reason: To ensure the provision, establishment and maintenance of a reasonable standard of landscape in accordance with the approved designs.

13 All hard and soft landscape works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details. The works shall be carried out before the use hereby permitted is commenced and prior to the completion of the development or in accordance with the programme agreed with the Local Planning Authority. If within a period of five years after planting any tree or plant is removed, dies or becomes, in the opinion of the Local Planning Authority, seriously damaged, defective or diseased another tree or plant of the same species and size as that originally approved shall be planted at the same place, within the next planting season, unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.

Reason: To ensure the provision, establishment and maintenance of a reasonable standard of landscape in accordance with the approved designs.

14 A landscape management plan, including long term design objectives, management responsibilities and maintenance schedules for all landscape areas, specifically the woodland area to the front of the site, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the occupation of the development or any phase of the development, whichever is the sooner, for its permitted use. The landscape management plan shall be carried out in accordance with the details hereby approved.

Reason: To ensure that due regard is paid to the continuing enhancement and maintenance of amenity afforded by landscape features of communal, public, nature conservation and historic significance.

15 No development or site preparation prior to operations which has any effect on disturbing or altering the level of composition of the land, shall take place within the site until the applicant or their agents or successors in title has secured the implementation of a programme of archaeological work in accordance with a written scheme of investigation to be submitted by the applicant and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To ensure that the archaeological interest of the site is properly safeguarded and recorded.

16 No development, or works of site preparation or clearance, shall take place until details, including plans and cross sections of the existing and proposed ground levels of the development and the boundaries of the site and the height of the ground floor slab and damp proof course in relation thereto, have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To ensure a satisfactory relationship between the new development and adjacent buildings, amenity areas and trees.

Informatives

1. This permission is granted for the following reasons:

The development is in accordance with the Policies and Proposals of the Development Plan set out below, and other material considerations do not have sufficient weight to justify a refusal of the application. In accordance with Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004, planning permission should therefore be granted.

2. The Local Planning Authority has taken account of the following development plan policies and proposals:-

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

Hampshire County Structure Plan Review: UB1, UB3, H5, H7, R2, E8, E16, T2, T5 and T6.
Winchester District Local Plan Proposals: DP1, DP3, DP4, DP5, CE23, HE1, HE4, HE5, HE6,
HE7, HE8, H4, H7, RT4, T2 and T4.

There is a public foul sewer in Compton Street and this must be used in preference to any other method for the disposal of foul water.