Winchester City Council Planning Department Development Control

# **Committee Decision**

#### TEAM MANAGER SIGN OFF SHEET

Case No:	06/03532/FUL	Valid Date	5 December 2006	
W No:	02502/18	Recommendation Date	30 January 2007	
Case Officer:	Mrs Jill Lee	8 Week Date	30 January 2007	
		Committee date	21 February 2007	
Recommendation:	Application Refused	Decision:	Committee Decision	

Proposal:Erection of new office building consisting of 6 no office units over three floors with enclosed<br/>ground floor parking for four cars and partial demolition of workshop adjacent to the mill<br/>(RE-SUBMISSION)

Site: Station Mill Station Road Alresford Hampshire SO24 9JQ

Open Space Y/N	Legal Agreement	S.O.S	Objections	EIA Development	Monitoring Code	Previous Developed Land
NO	Ν	Ν	N	Ν	Ν	Y

DELEGATED ITEM SIGN OFF					
<b>APPROVE</b> Subject to the condition(s) listed		<b>REFUSE</b> for the reason(s) listed			
	Signature		Date		
CASE OFFICER					
TEAM MANAGER					

# AMENDED PLANS DATE:- 6 February 2007.

Item No: Case No: Proposal Description:	Item 1 06/03532/FUL / W02502/18 Erection of new office building consisting of 6 no office units over three floors with enclosed ground floor parking for four cars and partial demolition of workshop adjacent to the mill (RE-SUBMISSION)
Address:	Station Mill Station Road Alresford Hampshire SO24 9JQ
Parish/Ward:	New Alresford
Applicants Name:	Mr T Gard
Case Officer:	Mrs Jill Lee
Date Valid:	5 December 2006
Site Factors:	
Recommendation:	Within 50m of Listed Building Within 50m of Listed Building Application Refused

#### **General Comments**

This application is reported to Committee at the request of the Director of Development.

This application is a re – submission of a scheme which was previously refused under delegated powers on 14 September 2006 (06/02477/FUL). There are few differences between this scheme and the one which was previously refused and these are outlined below. Prior to that the application for the new office building was refused at committee on 20 April 2006 (06/00162/FUL).

There is also a listed building application for the conversion of the existing building to residential (06/03537/LIS) and a full planning application for the conversion of this building to residential (06/03536/FUL) which are reported elsewhere on this agenda. Previously these proposals were all included within the same application and were refused under delegated powers on 14 September 2006 (06/02477/FUL).

Amended plans have been submitted to show correctly the siting of the new building in relation to the Mill building. The new building is sited 675mm away from the side wall of the Mill building. The overall height of the new building has been reduced by 300mm. The two render panels on the side elevation were removed at the time of the previous refusal and are still omitted from the application.

# **Site Description**

The application site is located at the end of Station Road in Alresford adjacent to the station car park.

Station Mill is a grade II listed building and is also within the New Alresford conservation area and is currently operating in a B1a use. Planning permission was granted on 29 March 2006 for its conversion into residential (04/02770/FUL).

There is a single storey workshop building positioned between the Mill and the car park, which is not listed.

To the north of the site is a steep well treed bank that separates the site from the church yard to the rear. Also to the north is the boundary with the police station. The southern boundary is with the car park to the station which is very well used. To the east is Station Road with the doctors surgery on the opposite side of the road.

The remainder of the site is given over to car parking for the users of the Mill.

## Proposal

It is proposed to erect a new office building consisting of 6 units of accommodation over three floors and car parking under. The building is to be constructed in brick with some feature render panels and a slate roof. The total floor area would be 465m<sup>2</sup> and the height 11.875m.

#### **Relevant Planning History**

Planning permission for largely the same office building was refused at planning development control committee on 20/04/2006 (06/00162/FUL). The same scheme was subsequently resubmitted in a package which also included the conversion of the Mill building and was refused under delegated powers on 14 September 2006 (06/02477/FUL).

#### Consultations

Conservation:

Object to the application. The new building is of a design and detailing which makes it less subservient to the Mill than the building that has consent.

Engineers: Drainage:

No objection to the proposal subject to building regulations consent being approved. Engineers: Highways:

No highways objections subject to conditions that were identified at the time of the previous application.

Landscape:

The proposed protective fencing is acceptable and in accordance with BS, this should be conditioned if permission is to be granted.

#### Environment Agency:

Object to the application. The risk to controlled waters has not been fully identified. The desk top study submitted does not contain sufficient information to fully identify any potential contaminants on site and the potential risk to controlled waters.

#### **Representations:**

New Alresford Town Council

Reiterate their previous comments and support the application which is an improvement of the original design and fulfils the perceived need for office accommodation.

# **Relevant Planning Policy:**

Hampshire County Structure Plan Review: E16 Winchester District Local Plan Review: DP13, HE4, HE5, HE16 National Planning Policy Guidance/Statements: PPG 15 Planning and the historic environment PPS 23 Planning and Pollution Control

# **Planning Considerations**

#### Principle of development

The application site is located within the settlement boundary of New Alresford where the principle of new development is acceptable subject to normal development control criteria. The site is also within the conservation area and within the curtilage of a grade II listed building where extra care should be afforded to design and detailing of new buildings.

In this case there is also an existing permission for a new office building which has to be taken into account.

Previously consent was granted for the change of use of the Mill to residential (04/02770/FUL) with the lost commercial floor space to be provided in a new building. The two approved schemes were linked by condition to ensure that the residential accommodation was not provided without the new office building. The office building that was approved was considered to be acceptable in terms of its height, design and bulk both in relation to the conservation area and the listed Mill building.

The current application proposes changes from the approved scheme which are considered to be sufficiently harmful to the setting of the listed building and impact within the conservation area to warrant refusing the application.

The principle of development is therefore not acceptable.

#### Design/layout

The proposed alterations to the approved scheme would result in a larger building 2m wider and 1.1m higher than the approved scheme. The new building is also 0.6m closer to the listed Mill building and incorporates a large projection to the rear of the building which would house a lift shaft.

When the new office building was originally proposed the design and materials were negotiated in order to secure a good quality scheme which was sympathetic to the listed building and the conservation area. The use of render instead of brick was thought to be preferable as it reinforced the idea that the new building was distinct from and subservient to the listed building. The brick work on the listed Mill building was considered difficult to imitate successfully and if constructed in brick the new building could appear as a poor copy of the Mill which should remain as the dominant building on the site.

The proportions and numbers of windows have been altered from the approved scheme to include two further vertical lines of windows, which results in 6 additional windows on each end elevation which are considered to emphasise the additional height and width of the building. The additional windows and bulk of building alter the proportions of the building and take away the vertical emphasis. They also have the effect of increasing the overall impact which is detrimental to the setting of the listed building and the conservation area.

The application site is sensitive being within the curtilage of a listed building and the conservation area. It is also very visible from the public realm and therefore the design and appearance of the new building is very important. The proposed changes from the approved design are not considered to be acceptable and would result in a development that would detract both from the character and amenities of the conservation area and the setting of the listed building.

## Impact on setting of listed building and conservation area.

Compared to the approved scheme this proposal is 0.6m closer to the listed building and so will have a greater impact on it. It is also 2m wider than the approved scheme and 1.1m higher. The new building has been designed to imitate the listed building and is to be constructed in brick which will have the effect of creating a building which is similar to the listed Mill building and which will not appear as a distinct building. This will detract from the importance of the Mill and impinge on its setting to an unacceptable degree. The proposed new building is now only 0.5m narrower than the Mill building and is of a size and bulk that competes with the Mill rather than being subservient to it.

#### Landscape/Trees

The trees on the bank to the rear of the proposed new office building are to be retained and protective fencing has been proposed which is acceptable. It is considered that the proposed new building can be constructed without detriment to the trees, which are an important feature within the street scene and conservation area.

#### Highways/Parking

The scheme has no adverse highways implications and provides car parking for the office use to an acceptable standard.

#### Recommendation

Application Refused for the following reasons:

#### Reasons

1 The proposed new office building would be contrary to PPG15, policy E16 of the Hampshire County Structure Plan Review and policies HE4, HE5 and HE16 of the Winchester District Local Plan Review in that it would result in a building which would by reason of its design, bulk and appearance detract from the adjacent listed building and detract from the character and visual amenities of the conservation area.

2 The proposed development is contrary to the provisions of PPS23 and policy DP13 of the Winchester District Local Plan Review in that there is insufficient information to demonstrate that the risk of pollution to controlled waters is acceptable.

# Informatives:

The Local Planning Authority has taken account of the following development plan policies and proposals:-

Hampshire County Structure Plan Review: E16 Winchester District Local Plan Review: DP13, HE4, HE5, HE16