

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

Winchester City
Council
Planning Department
Development Control

TEAM MANAGER
SIGN OFF SHEET

Committee Decision

Case No:	07/00185/FUL	Valid Date	24 January 2007
W No:	18702/06	Recommendation Date	12 February 2007
Case Officer:	Ms Elizabeth Stewart	8 Week Date	21 March 2007
		Committee date	29th March 2007
Recommendation:	Application Refused	Decision:	Committee Decision

Proposal:	Conversion of barn into 3 no. dwellings and renovation of cottage with new single storey link extension to converted cart shed; conversion of workshop to garaging and storage
------------------	--

Site:	Barn And Stable 30m SE Of Farmhouse West Hoe Farm West Hoe Lane Bishops Waltham Hampshire
--------------	---

Open Space Y/N	Legal Agreement	S.O.S	Objections	EIA Development	Monitoring Code	Previous Developed Land
Y	N	N	Y	N	N	Y

DELEGATED ITEM SIGN OFF		
APPROVE Subject to the condition(s) listed	REFUSE for the reason(s) listed	
	Signature	Date
CASE OFFICER		
TEAM MANAGER		

AMENDED PLANS DATE:-

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

Item No: Item 3
Case No: 07/00185/FUL / W18702/06
Proposal Description: Conversion of barn into 3 no. dwellings and renovation of cottage with new single storey link extension to converted cart shed; conversion of workshop to garaging and storage
Address: Barn And Stable 30m SE Of Farmhouse West Hoe Farm West Hoe Lane Bishops Waltham Hampshire
Parish/Ward: Bishops Waltham
Applicants Name: Mr C Maybury And S Glynn
Case Officer: Ms Elizabeth Stewart
Date Valid: 24 January 2007
Site Factors: Within 50m of Listed Building
Recommendation: Application Refused

General Comments

This application is reported to Committee at the request of Councillor Hammerton, whose request is appended in full to this report.

This application runs concurrently with a Listed Building application (reference 07/00186/LIS), which is included elsewhere on this agenda.

The application site has a relatively long and complicated history. Planning and Listed Building applications to convert the barn and stable into one dwelling, to repair the cottage for domestic use and to refurbish the workshop as an office were approved in July 2005, following one withdrawal and two refused applications.

Site Description

The site consists of 1.5 hectares of land adjoining West Hoe Lane near the junction with Hoe Road. The site is located on the eastern edge of Bishops Waltham outside the defined settlement boundary and in the Local Gap between Bishops Waltham and Swanmore.

The site comprises a long brick and flint barn, which is a Grade II Listed Building. The barn is orientated in a north south direction extending for a length of approximately 40m. The southern most section of this building comprises 2 stable blocks. A more recent lean-to brick section has been added to the front of the building, in between the two main openings of the barn. An orange brick building (formerly a dairy house) lies to the west of the barn complex adjacent West Hoe Lane. To the south of the aforementioned buildings is a timber cart shed and what was originally Yoemans cottage. The cottage is now disused and in a state of disrepair. A 0.5m stone wall extends along the northern and eastern perimeters of the former cottage. The northern, eastern and southern site boundaries are well defined by way of substantial hedgerows, while a 1m (approximately) stone wall defines the south western site boundary. The site is served by two access egress points off West Hoe Lane and Hoe Lane.

Land to the east of the complex of farm buildings is characterised by open paddock/agricultural land, while land immediately to the north and west of the application site, comprises four numbered large residential dwellings on spacious plots. Land in all other aspects is predominantly agricultural.

The application site gradually descends away from the main barn in a southerly direction.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

Proposal

The application seeks full planning permission for the conversion of an existing Grade II Listed farm building into three residential units, renovation of a derelict cottage with new single storey link extension to a converted cart shed; and conversion of workshop/pigsties to garaging and storage.

The proposed barn conversion would comprise 2 two bedroom units and 1 one bed unit, which face onto West Hoe lane. The renovation of the derelict cottage to the south of the existing barn complex would comprise a 2 bed cottage, which would be linked to the cart shed to the west by way of a single storey extension. It is then proposed to convert the existing cart shed into a living/study area for the cottage. A low brick wall is proposed to delineate the boundary between the cottage and the barn complex.

The existing workshop/pigsties would be converted into a 4 bay garage with 4 separate store rooms. A bin store is proposed to the north of the garage/storage area, fronting onto West Hoe Lane.

Access to the development would be served off an existing access point in West Hoe Lane. The front entrance of the development site, shall be landscaped by way of several Silver Birch Trees.

Land extending approximately 115 metres to the east of the development complex shall form part of the residential curtilage of the application site.

Relevant Planning History

W18702 Conversion of existing redundant agricultural buildings to form five bedroom dwelling and detached ancillary office - Barn & Stable 30m SE Of Farmhouse West Hoe Farm West Hoe Lane Bishops Waltham Hampshire - Application Withdrawn - 10/03/2004

W18702/01LB Alterations to convert existing redundant agricultural buildings into a dwelling and office, demolition of lean-to addition to front - Barn & Stable 30m SE Of Farmhouse West Hoe Farm West Hoe Lane Bishops Waltham Hampshire - Application Withdrawn - 10/03/2004

W18702/02LB Alterations to convert existing redundant agricultural buildings into a dwelling and office, demolition of lean to addition to front - Barn & Stable 30m SE Of Farmhouse West Hoe Farm West Hoe Lane Bishops Waltham Hampshire - Application Refused - 07/09/2004

W18702/03 Conversion of existing redundant agricultural buildings to form five bedroom dwelling and detached ancillary office - Barn & Stable 30m SE Of Farmhouse West Hoe Farm West Hoe Lane Bishops Waltham Hampshire - Application Refused - 08/06/2005

W18702/04LB Restoration and conversion of barn into dwelling, disused former farmhouse into a dwelling and redundant cattle shed into an office - Barn & Stable 30m SE Of Farmhouse West Hoe Farm West Hoe Lane Bishops Waltham Hampshire - Application Permitted - 28/11/2005

W18702/05 Restoration and conversion of barn into dwelling, derelict former farmhouse into dwelling and redundant cattle shed into office - Barn & Stable 30m SE Of Farmhouse West Hoe Farm West Hoe Lane Bishops Waltham Hampshire - Application Permitted - 01/08/2005

Consultations

Southern Water: No comments

Environment Agency: No objection in principle. Request imposition of planning conditions.

Conservation: Scheme contrary to Policy HE.17 and countryside policies.

- New openings and internal subdivision of Listed Barn will result in the loss of historic fabric of the barn complex.
- The landscaping of the farmyard and the conversion of agricultural land to the east to form part of the residential curtilage of the development complex would adversely impact on the

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

setting of the listed building.

- The cart shed to the southwest of the cottage is not considered of significant historic interest to merit conversion to residential use and should more appropriately be used for garaging/storage.
- The extension of the cowshed to provide garaging will result in the loss of the pigsties which are important to the understanding of this early 20th century curtilage listed farm building.
- The proposed residential use will result in an unacceptable degree of subdivision and harmful intervention to the historic farm buildings.

Landscape:

- The site lies within the countryside and within the defined Local Gap between Bishops Waltham and Swanmore. As the buildings are existing it is not considered that the development will physically or visually diminish the local gap under Policy CE.3(i).
- The field to the east of the dwelling has been included within the red line of the application site and divided up with the properties. The red line of the application should be reduced to the curtilage of the yard area, to avoid the field becoming garden extensions with all the potential associated features, which would have a detrimental impact on the character of the countryside.
- The location of the bin store is too close to West Hoe Lane to allow retention and reinforcement of the planting belt which encloses the site.
- Extensive area of hard landscape within the yard area should be reduced, to discourage parking of cars in front of the building as much as possible and the areas in front of the dwellings simply grassed, to provide some outdoor space associated with each dwelling.

Highways:

Adequate car & cycle parking together with on site turning has been provided. Concerns over sustainability. Request imposition of planning conditions should officers be minded to approve the application.

Access Development Team: No objections

Estates:

Condition of buildings would result in a limited commercial use of buildings. However they do not appear to have advertised these to let out at an appropriate level to reflect their condition. Land values will be enhanced if converted to residential units.

Archaeology:

Development has archaeological implications as the application site comprises a historic farm complex, which includes a listed building.

- Development constitutes a significant alteration to the original function and internal spatial characteristics of the listed building. The proposed refurbishment, alteration and extension to the outer buildings on the site may also impact on historic fabric. Recommend that a programme of historic building recording should be carried out in order to provide for a full archive record of this historic building complex prior to any alterations, refurbishment and conversion.
- Groundwork's associated with the development may have detrimental impact on any buried archaeological remains. A watching brief is recommended.

If Officers minded to approve scheme recommend imposition of planning conditions.

Representations:

Bishops Waltham Parish Council = Object:

- Proposal unacceptable by reason of the excessive alteration of the fabric of the building which contributes to the architectural interest of the building.
- Proposal would represent undesirable additional dwellings for which there is no overriding justification in an area of countryside.
- Overdevelopment.

2 letters received: support and objection:

- Pleased that there are plans for residential use. Commercial use would be inappropriate for the site.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

- Satisfactory solution to the conversion of derelict buildings into attractive residential premises.
- of 4 No: dwellings on site is overdevelopment. Prefer to see 3 No: dwellings on site.
- Concern over volume of traffic entering and leaving.
- Roof window planned for the north elevation. This would overlook the front of West Hoe House. Suggest this window is frosted.
- Concerned that fields to rear of development would be altered from their present use.

Relevant Planning Policy:

Hampshire County Structure Plan Review:

C1, C2, H10, E14, E16, R2

Winchester District Local Plan Review

DP.3; DP.4; CE.2; CE.3; CE.5; CE.24; H.4; HE.1; HE.13; HE.14; HE.16; HE.17; H4; H7

National Planning Policy Guidance/Statements:

PPS 1 Delivering Sustainable Development

PPS 7 Sustainable Development in Rural Areas

PPG 15 Planning and the historic environment

PPG 16 Archaeology and planning

PPG 17 Planning for Open Space, Sport and Recreation

Supplementary Planning Guidance

N/A

Planning Considerations

- Principle of development/History
- History
- Impact upon the listed buildings
- Impact on the character of the area
- Sustainability
- Economic considerations
- Highways
- Public Open Space provision
- Impact on amenities of adjacent occupiers

Principle of development/History

Relevant planning policy favours the reuse of buildings in the countryside for business purposes, and residential use would only be allowed if the buildings would be unsuitable for commercial activities. Furthermore, where the building is of historical or architectural merit, conversion to residential use will only be accepted where the building; is incapable of being used in a more suitable way; is part of a comprehensive strategy for the whole site and; where the building is of a design and construction that is suitable for conversion without substantial alteration, rebuilding or extension.

History

In order to properly assess the merits of this application, consideration needs to be given to the history of the site. The most recent and pertinent application(s) (ref: 05/01101/FUL and 05/01102/LIS) were submitted in 2005 for the following works:

“To convert the barn and stable into one 5-bed dwelling, to restore an existing derelict cottage and create a 2-bed dwelling and convert a redundant cattle shed into an office”

The application was presented to planning Committee in July 2005, and the Officer recommendation was that the application(s) be refused because of concerns relating to possible

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

alternative uses, impact upon listed buildings and their settings, effect on the countryside, archaeology and the reuse of the former dwelling.

Notwithstanding the recommendation, members were satisfied that the development was satisfactory and the Committee resolved to approve the aforementioned scheme, subject to the imposition of planning conditions.

Accordingly, in determining this current application, and in light of the aforementioned planning approval, it is appropriate to use the permitted scheme as a “baseline” for determining the current application, and to establish if the proposed scheme will be materially harmful/destructive to the historic form of the listed building and its setting, relative to extant permissions.

Impact upon the Listed Buildings

PPG15: Planning and the Historic Environment, advises that the best way to preserve a listed building is to find the optimum viable use that is compatible with the fabric, interior, and setting of the historic building. Planning Policies HE.13 and HE.14 of the Winchester District Local Plan Review, also specify that proposals which would be harmful to any features of special architectural or historical interest will not be supported. Accordingly, in judging the effect of any alteration or extension to a listed building it is essential to have assessed the elements that make up its special interest and to then assess the impact and acceptability of proposed works.

In this instance, given the listed barn was originally built for storage purposes, the interior of the barn remains open and is characterised by a long rectangular space spanned by seven open trusses and a hip truss at each end. Aside from the timber double doors to the west and east of the barn, and the rows of smaller ventilation slots the main barn does not exhibit any additional openings. The stable barn to the south (which is a later addition) is divided into units, with a hayloft over, accessed by two half doors facing west and internal trap doors.

Whilst it is acknowledged that planning permission has already been approved for an element of residential use on site (2 dwellings – 1 within the barn and refurbishment of the cottage), the extant planning permission is considered to be less harmful to the historic fabric of the listed building and its setting. This is evident through the retention of the internal space and general sense of openness of the main barn and the minimal number of new external openings to the façade of the building. Furthermore, the existing buildings (Yeomans cottage, cartshed and former dairy) within the curtilage of the barn complex sought to respect the setting of the listed building.

In contrast the current scheme seeks to intensify the number of residential units on site from 2 to 4 (3 units in the barn and the refurbishment of the cottage) and extend the overall curtilage of residential use entailed with the development. As a result of this it is considered that the form of development is incompatible with the historic fabric of the building and detrimental to the setting of the listed building in general. To elaborate on the extent of works proposed it is considered appropriate to consider the impacts of works proposed to each of the respective buildings:

Barn

As a result of the intensification of the proposed development, the barn will be subdivided through means of inserting walls and first floor divisions. This will severely compromise the internal space and sense of openness which are currently characteristic of the building. Partition walls or glazed screens will further be inserted along the truss lines, subdividing the barn into 6 compartments, leaving only the wagon bays being open to the roof. The combined effect of this internal subdivision will be to create a much more domestic character than the original scheme and would adversely and unacceptably impact upon the character of the listed building.

Detailed drawings submitted in support of the scheme further indicate that six strips of high level horizontal windows are proposed on the east elevation of the barn complex. This will inevitably

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

result in the loss of the top row of ventilation slots and fenestrate what is otherwise a blind elevation. As flint is a friable material, this may disturb part of the form of the barn complex and require reconstruction.

In addition to this, two staircases are proposed to rise in front of each glazed wagon bay, which will interrupt what should be a clear open space which can be appreciated from outside and within the listed building. The addition of two new door openings are further proposed to be punched through the flint wall to provide entrances, further increasing the domestic nature of the development proposed and detracting from the original historic form of the structure. The Council's Conservation Officer advises that if the building were to remain in single use (as approved under planning references 05/01101/FUL and 05/01102/LIS) these modifications would not be necessary and would therefore retain some of the original historic fabric of the building.

Stable

The conversion of the stable block will result in the insertion of 4 new window openings to the blind east elevation and 2 roof lights. This is considered to be harmful to the character of the listed farm building. The blind elevation of this listed building is an essential feature which should be preserved. The proposed insertion of these new openings will give it an overtly domestic character and this will be experienced in views from across the fields.

Cottage/cartshed

Whilst the principle of restoring Yeomans cottage has formerly been accepted by virtue of permissions 05/01101/FUL and 05/01102/LIS, it is considered that the proposed link extension and cartshed conversion is unnecessary; especially in light of the fact the cartshed is not of sufficient architectural/historic interest to merit conversion to residential use. Accordingly, it is considered that this element would be better retained to provide a workshop or garage.

Dairy

The dairy house/pigsties, whilst not individually listed, are afforded protection since they predate 1948 and remain within the curtilage of the listed building. While not of the same age or significance as the listed barn, they are of interest as an early 20th century farm building as they provide some level of understanding to former farm practices. The loss of the integral pair of brick pigsties for a garage is therefore considered to be regrettable and detracts from the setting of the listed building.

Archaeological implications

In light of the historical fabric of the barn, it is considered that any groundwork's associated with the proposed development may have a detrimental impact on any buried archaeological remains associated with the historic complex. The application as submitted has not provided a programme of archaeological investigation and recording on site. It is therefore considered that the proposed development is potentially detrimental to this historical conservation of the site.

Impact on the character of the area

The application site is in a relatively prominent position and readily visible from Hoe Road, in both a westerly and easterly approach.

Land immediately to the north, northeast and west of the dwelling is characterised by large two storey residential dwellings on spacious open fronted plots. Land in all other aspects is predominantly characterised by arable/agricultural land.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

The proposed external modifications to the buildings (aside from the refurbishment of the cottage, and the link) will not increase the overall mass of existing structures on site. In this respect, it is considered that the development will not adversely impact upon the overall character of the area/openness of the gap.

With regard to the proposed works to the farm cottage and the link to the cart shed, the scheme would result in an increased level of visual intrusion into the countryside. However, given the site has historically included a cottage, it is not considered that the proposed refurbishment of this element of the scheme will materially harm the character of the area in general.

This matter aside it is noted that the application site extends approximately 115 metres to the east of the existing barn/stable complex. In contrast the original planning scheme limited the extent of the associated residential curtilage immediately to the rear of the barn complex. Should the current scheme be permitted, the development would ultimately change the character of this arable parcel of land into land which forms part the residential curtilage of the development complex. This in turn would be likely to lead to the domestication of the land through the inclusion of associated residential paraphernalia (e.g. the erection of fences, sheds, swings etc). Consequently, it is considered that this would materially change the character of the site to the detriment of the setting of the listed building, the countryside and the Bishops Waltham – Swanmore local gap.

In addition to this the detailed drawings submitted in support of the scheme indicate that the courtyard to the west of the complex shall be landscaped by way of Silver Birch trees. These particular species are considered to be alien to the rural character of this open space and detrimental to the setting of the adjacent listed building.

Sustainability

Paragraph 17 of PPS7 acknowledges the importance of preserving buildings of historic importance. The need to preserve such historical buildings however should not be achieved at the expense of sustainability objectives. Accordingly, a balanced approach needs to be adopted.

As already noted, the current planning scheme seeks to introduce four new residential dwellings, outside the defined settlement boundary of Bishops Waltham. Given the lack of convenient accessibility to local services, facilities and public transport, it is considered that the proposed intensification of development on site is likely to lead to more car movements.

This matter is further highlighted when compared to the extant planning permission, which sought to maintain some degree of sustainability by way of accommodating a home office in the former dairy. This in turn afforded some degree of sustainability to the site, insofar that it sought to reduce the number of vehicular movements to and from the site. However, given local plan policies would permit a commercial reuse of the buildings which could generate more traffic than the four dwellings, a refusal on this basis would be difficult to sustain.

Economic considerations

The Agents report maintains that the proposed level of intensification on site is required, in order to ensure the scheme is financially viable. In relation to the extant permission, it was reported that the estimated cost of re-sale would be less than the total cost of development.

However, without a full breakdown of the total costs of work involved, and in light of the fact that the main part of the building is apparently of sound construction, it can be reasonably assumed that most of the costs are in conversion to residential, which is much more costly than if the building was to be returned to a weather tight state of repair and let out for alternative purposes.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

No formal justification or evidence has been submitted that states that the existing use of the buildings is no longer viable or that the possibility of employment or storage uses has been fully explored.

Highways

The Council is satisfied that the proposed scheme provides adequate facilities for onsite parking and manoeuvring. It is however recommended that the height of the boundary wall fronting onto Hoe Road, be lowered to provide for adequate visibility should members be minded to approve the scheme.

Public Open Space Provision

The Winchester District Open Space Strategy identifies the existing provision of children's play areas and sports grounds. It also identifies deficiencies in quantitative and qualitative terms on a parish basis. Accordingly, in determining new housing schemes, new development should incorporate or provide for sufficient space and recreational facilities to meet the needs of its residents.

In accordance with relevant planning policy, the Applicant has already provided a financial contribution and the proposed scheme therefore accords with this particular element of planning policy.

Impacts upon amenities of adjacent occupiers

Concerns raised by an adjacent occupier with regard to overlooking, can effectively be overcome by a suitably imposed planning condition, which seeks to ensure the window in question (first floor bathroom window) is obscured glazed. Removal of permitted development rights along this elevation would further seek to mitigate against issues relating to overlooking. Accordingly, it is not considered that this is a sufficient reason for refusal.

Recommendation

Application Refused for the following reasons:

- 1 The proposed development is contrary to Policies E14, E16 and H10 of the Hampshire County Structure Plan and Policies HE.1, HE.2, HE.13, HE.14, HE.16, HE.17 and CE.24 of the Winchester District Local Plan Review in that:-
 - (i) The new door, window openings, roof lights, sub-division of the barn, internal alterations to the barn and stable and loss of historic fabric would have an adverse effect on the special architectural and historic interest of the listed Barn and Stable.
 - (ii) The proposed residential use will result in an unacceptable degree of subdivision and harmful intervention to the historic fabric of the farm building.
 - (iii) The landscaping to the courtyard and bringing the agricultural land to the east of the barn and stable and cottage into the curtilage of the development would adversely affect the setting of the listed building's rural setting.
 - (iv) The cart shed to the southwest of the cottage is not considered to be of any significant historic interest to merit conversion to residential use.
 - (v) The extension of the cowshed to provide garaging will result in the loss of the pigsties which are important to the understanding of the early 20th Century curtilage listed farm building.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

- (vi) The proposed development fails to make satisfactory provision for a programme of archaeological investigation and recording before or during development, on a site which is considered to be of archaeological interest.
- 2 The proposed development is contrary to policies C1, C2, G3 and H10 of the Hampshire County Structure Plan and policies CE.2, CE.3, CE.5 and DP.4 of the Winchester District Local Plan Review in that:
- (i) The extent of the application site would bring existing agricultural land into use as the residential cartilage in association with the proposed dwellings. This in turn would detrimentally impact upon the character of the countryside and the Bishop's Waltham – Swanmore – Waltham Chase – Shedfield - Shirrell Heath Local Gap by virtue of the likely domestication of the land.
 - (ii) Insufficient evidence has been supplied to satisfy the Local Planning Authority that the buildings are incapable of beneficial use other than residential or that a residential conversion of the main barn and stable is effectively the only means of ensuring the long term retention of the Listed Building.

Informatives:

The Local Planning Authority has taken account of the following development plan policies and proposals:-

Hampshire County Structure Plan Review: C1, C2, H10, E14, E16, R2

Winchester District Local Plan Review: DP.3, DP.4, CE.2, CE.3, CE.5, CE.24, H.4, H.7, HE.1, HE.13, HE.14, HE.16, HE.17.