

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

Winchester City
Council
Planning Department
Development Control

TEAM MANAGER
SIGN OFF SHEET

Delegated Decision

Case No:	06/03228/LIS	Valid Date	27 October 2006
W No:	06941/22LB	Recommendation Date	9 March 2007
Case Officer:	Lisa Booth	8 Week Date	22 December 2006
		Committee date	
Recommendation:	Application Permitted	Decision:	Delegated Decision

Proposal:	(AMENDED DESCRIPTION _ PLANS) Two storey side and rear extensions and car port to front
------------------	---

Site:	Stable Cottage Ingoldfield Farm Ingoldfield Lane Soberton Southampton
--------------	---

Open Space Y/N	Legal Agreement	S.O.S	Objections	EIA Development	Monitoring Code	Previous Developed Land
	N	N	Y	N	N	N

DELEGATED ITEM SIGN OFF		
APPROVE Subject to the condition(s) listed	REFUSE for the reason(s) listed	
	Signature	Date
CASE OFFICER		
TEAM MANAGER		

AMENDED PLANS DATE:- 5th December 2006 & 16th January 2007

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

Item No: Item 10
Case No: 06/03228/LIS / W06941/22LB
Proposal Description: (AMENDED DESCRIPTION _ PLANS) Two storey side and rear extensions and car port to front
Address: Stable Cottage Ingoldfield Farm Ingoldfield Lane Soberton Southampton
Parish/Ward: Soberton
Applicants Name: Julian Godfrey And Sue Espley
Case Officer: Lisa Booth
Date Valid: 27 October 2006
Site Factors: Listed Building
Recommendation: Application Permitted

General Comments

This application is reported to Committee at the request of Soberton Parish Council, whose request is appended in full to this report

Amended plans were received on 5th December 2006 to reflect a reduction in the overall size of the scheme. Officers were not satisfied with the extent of the reductions and requested the scheme be reduced further. Additional amended plans were received on 16th January 2007 showing the proposed scheme further reduced in size on the rear two storey elements.

The scheme is effectively an amendment to extant planning permission W06941/17 granted by the Planning (Development Control) Committee on 20/12/2002. That permission allowed the existing property to be extended to a similar footprint as the proposal, but with a larger detached garage to the front of the property. In order to build the extant planning permission, it would require the demolition and alteration of a majority of the existing building, which is listed by virtue of its siting within the curtilage of Ingoldfield Farm.

The dwelling has previously been altered without either planning permission or listed building consent, which has led to some unsympathetic alterations. A Certificate of Lawful Development was granted (ref: WLDC/215) in 1998 for the change of use from stable to dwelling.

This application seeks to extend the building using the same footprint as the extant planning permission, but will not require any major demolition of the historic fabric and it is considered that it would provide a more sympathetic solution.

Site Description

The existing dwelling has a floor area of 136m², set in substantial grounds of 1.50ha (3.6 acres), and is one of a group of five dwellings, two of which are Grade II listed buildings.

Stable Cottage is a curtilage listed building by virtue of its siting within the curtilage of Ingoldfield Farm and is built from red brick and red clay tiles.

There are recent additions to the dwelling in the form of a conservatory to the rear and eye-brow dormers to the front and rear.

The property is well screened from the road by mature trees along the western and part northern boundaries. It is also hidden from view by Old Manor Barn to the west.

The property is slightly more open when approaching from the private access road which serves the small hamlet of five dwellings.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

There are views to open fields from the rear garden.

Access and parking leads from the private access road and is by way of a gravelled and landscaped area to the front of the dwelling.

Proposal

The proposal is to erect a two storey side extension, which is joined to the existing dwelling by a single storey link. An attached carport is proposed to the front of the property.

A further two storey extension to form a dining room and bedroom and balcony is proposed on the rear of the existing dwelling.

The existing eyebrow dormers to the rear and other fenestration are to be replaced with more sympathetic windows and doors. The conservatory and bay window are also to be removed. Parking arrangements will be as existing, but with the addition of a 2 bay carport at the front. The proposal is 2.2m from the boundary with Whaysai and 2m from the boundary with Old Manor Barn. However, the distances between the two properties are 27m with Old Manor Barn and 20m with Whaysai.

The existing dwelling has a floor area of 136m² and the proposed extensions and car port resulting in a floor area of 244m². The extant planning permission for extensions and a garage would result in a floor area of 245m².

Relevant Planning History

WLDC/215 - Change of use from stable to dwelling (Certificate of Lawfulness) – Permitted
25/08/1998

W06941/12 – Two storey side and rear extension. Replacement conservatory to rear – Refused
20/06/2001

W06941/17 – Single storey front, rear and side extensions and detached double carport and log store – Permitted 19/12/2002

Consultations

Conservation:

“This is part of the curtilage to Ingoldfield Farm and an historic farm building and must be considered to be a curtilage building. The building was converted to residential use some time ago without the benefit of Listed Building consent or planning permission. Subsequently a Certificate of Lawful Use was granted, but no Listed Building Consent. There have been several pre-application enquiries and it was agreed that an application in this form might be acceptable if it respected the remaining historic fabric and character of the building and did not enlarge the building further than permission W06941/17. However, since these discussions the footprint of the building has grown and it is no longer considered that this application respects the remaining character of the building or preserves the farmyard setting.”

Further comments after amended plans were submitted reducing the size of the extensions:

“As discussed on site, this now has clear advantages over the previously approved scheme. As such I would be willing to support this application.”

Engineers: Highways:

“No new access or alterations to existing access are to occur.

From the submitted plans sufficient area appears to exist to provide acceptable on site parking and turning facilities.

It is unlikely that the proposals will lead to a material increase in traffic or cause demonstrable harm to users of the adjoining highway.”

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

Representations:

Soberton Parish Council

Proposal fails to comply with the Parish Village Design Statement in that the extension is not subservient to the existing building. Proposals are too large and overwhelming for the existing cottage and are not sympathetic in character.

No other letters of representation have been received in respect of the application

Relevant Planning Policy:

Hampshire County Structure Plan Review:

UB3, C1, C2, E16

Winchester District Local Plan Review

DP3, CE23, HE14, HE16

National Planning Policy Guidance/Statements:

PPS 1 Delivering Sustainable Development

PPG 15 Planning and the historic environment

Supplementary Planning Guidance

Soberton Village Design Statement

Planning Considerations

Principle of development

History

Impact on character of listed building

Principle of development

In terms of this listed building application, which accompanies the planning application, PPG15 states: *“The preservation of facades alone and the gutting and reconstruction of interiors is not normally an acceptable approach to the re-use of listed buildings: it can destroy much of a building's special interest and create problems for the long-term stability of the structure.”*

Policies HE14 of the Winchester District Local Plan Review (WDLPR) does not permit any external or internal alterations or addition to a listed building, which would adversely affect its architectural or historic character.

The building is listed by virtue of its historical association with Ingoldfield Farm. However, its original character and special interest was significantly diminished when the building was converted into a dwelling without consent some years ago. Consequently, whilst listed, the building has limited architectural and historic value. This proposal seeks to reflect the historic form and structural integrity of the building.

History

Historically, the building was a stable and is listed by virtue of the fact it was within the curtilage of Ingoldfield Farm. A considerable period of time ago the building was converted into a dwelling (without planning permission) and the associated alterations diminished significantly the structure's additional architectural/historic interest. The Council granted a Lawful Development Certificate for a dwelling in 1998.

In 2002, permission was granted to extend the property and this would have involved extensive alterations to the historic structure, including increasing the height of the roof and the removal of a main wall in connection with the erection of a 2 storey side extension.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

Impact on character of listed building

It is acknowledged that the works now proposed are significant in scale and will have a significant material impact upon the building's character. However, it is considered that this scheme is more sympathetic to the buildings character, especially in terms of its scale and layout compared to the earlier scheme and would maintain the basic scale and form of the existing building, especially when viewed from the north.

The main extension would constitute a separate element to the house and will be linked by means of a single storey structure. It would 'read' as a subservient development when viewed in relation to the main building. The alterations to the south elevation of the existing building are significant, but would have the benefit of removing unsympathetic dormer windows and a conservatory and will respect the scale and form of the historic structure. The basic layout of the building would be maintained and it is considered that the internal alterations are acceptable.

Conclusion

Taking into account the history of the building and the nature of the previous permission granted, it is considered that, on balance, the works to the listed building are acceptable and will be in keeping with the overall form and scale of the property.

Recommendation

Application Permitted subject to the following condition(s):

Conditions

1 The works hereby consented to shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.

Reason: To comply with the provision of Section 18(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (as amended).

2 The development hereby permitted shall be constructed using bricks, mortar and tiles to match those on the existing building. If any materials or their means of fixing are not identical to the original then drawn details and samples of these materials shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority, prior to the commencement of works. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the subsequently approved details and materials.

Reason: To maintain the architectural interest of the building.

3 Prior to commencement of works a sample panel of brickwork and tiling shall be constructed for the consideration of the Local Planning Authority. When a panel has been completed that meets with the approval of the Local Planning Authority and such approval has been confirmed in writing, then the development hereby approved shall be finished in a manner identical to the approved panel.

Reason: To ensure the detailing and materials maintain the architectural interest of the building.

4 All rainwater goods shall be of cast iron unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To protect the character and appearance of the listed building.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE AGENDA

- 5 Any part of the building exposed by the demolition work shall be made good and the safety and stability of the part of the building that is to be retained shall be ascertained by a report from a suitably qualified structural or civil engineer. Before the works of demolition commence that report is to be supplied to and agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of the preservation and character of the listed building

- 6 Full details of all new windows and doors shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of work. The windows and doors shall be installed in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To protect the character and appearance of the listed building

Informatives:

- 1 This permission is granted for the following reasons:

The development is in accordance with the Policies and Proposals of the Development Plan set out below, and other material considerations do not have sufficient weight to justify a refusal of the application. In accordance with Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004, planning permission should therefore be granted.

02 The Local Planning Authority has taken account of the following development plan policies and proposals:-

Hampshire County Structure Plan Review: UB3, C1, C2, E16
Winchester District Local Plan Review Policies: DP3, CE23, HE14, HE16