## PLANNING (VIEWING) SUB-COMMITTEE

## 11 June 2015

Attendance:

Councillors:

Ruffell (Chairman) (P)

Dibden (P) Evans (P) Izard (P) Jeffs (P) Johnston (P) McLean (P) Scott (P) Tait (P)

Officers in attendance:

Ms Z Croad– Conservation Officer Mrs J Pinnock – Head of Development Management Mrs A Swain – Principal Planning Officer Mrs T Wilson – Principal Legal Officer

Others in attendance who did not address the meeting:

Councillor Simon Cook.

# 1. DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

By way of a personal statement, Councillor Jeffs explained that he had predetermined his decision in respect of the applications for the former Hampshire Constabulary Building and Station Mill, Station Road, Alresford following discussion with the site owner. Councillor Jeffs therefore sat apart from the Committee during its determination of both applications.

2. <u>DEMOLITION OF THE POLICE CONSTABULARY BUILDING AND THE</u> <u>ERECTION OF THREE STOREY DETACHED BUILDING COMPRISING 15</u> <u>RETIREMENT APARTMENTS; CONVERSION AND EXTENSION OF</u> <u>STATION MILL TO FORM 5 RETIREMENT APARTMENTS. ALTERATIONS</u> <u>TO ACCESSES; SURFACE AND BASEMENT LEVEL PARKING AND</u> <u>LANDSCAPED GROUNDS (AFFECTS THE SETTING OF A LISTED</u> <u>BUILDING) - FORMER HAMPSHIRE CONSTABULARY BUILDING AND</u> <u>STATION MILL, STATION ROAD, ALRESFORD.</u> <u>CASE NUMBER: 14/02953/FUL</u>

(Extract from PDC1026 Item 5 and Update Sheet dated 28 May 2015 refers)

At its meeting held on 28 May 2015, the Planning Committee agreed that the above application be referred to the Planning (Viewing) Sub-Committee for determination, to allow Members to assess the proposed developments in relation to their setting. Public participation had taken place at the meeting of the Committee held on 28 May 2015 where David Williams (Planning

consultant on behalf of applicant) spoke in support. Ward Councillors Simon Cook and Jeffs had also spoken on this item.

Therefore, immediately prior to the public meeting, the Viewing Sub-Committee visited the application site where it observed the location of the existing buildings, the gardens to the rear of the site and the degree of shading and the general provision of amenity space for residents. The potential impact of the development on the setting of the listed building at Station Mill was also taken into consideration.

The Head of Development Management added that although the current business tenants of Station Mill were moving out of the Mill as the presumption was that it would be converted, there remained a strong need for business accommodation in Alresford and the Mill should be retained for start up businesses. In addition, a more sympathetically coloured red brick had now been chosen rather than the yellow brick originally proposed, which was acceptable.

The Conservation Officer explained that there was support for the good design of the new buildings, but the new extension attached to the Listed Building would impact more on its special interest than was necessary. In particular, the loss of three windows and brickwork on the ground and first floors and a central window on the first floor would harm the special interest through loss of historic fabric. There may be alternative schemes that would be less harmful to the special interest of the Listed Building.

Following debate, Members expressed their support for the scheme in principle, but were agreed that the impact of the proposals on the Listed Building at Station Mill was unacceptable and that it was possible that an amended application could achieve an acceptable scheme. The application was therefore refused.

### **RESOLVED**:

That the decision taken on the Planning Application in relation to Former Hampshire Constabulary Building and Station Mill, Station Road, Alresford (Case number: 14/02953/FUL refers), be refused for the following reasons as set out in Report PDC1026 and in the Update Sheet dated 28 May 2015.

### Reasons:

- The conversion of the Mill to residential, with no replacement employment accommodation, does not fulfil the criteria of policy CP9 of the Local Plan Part 1 (LPP1). Furthermore, the proposal is contrary to policy MTRA1 of the LPP1 which seeks to retain existing employment premises to provide and improve local employment opportunities.
- 2. The proposal, by way of extension to the historic Mill building is considered to be over dominant in form, scale and massing and

requires considerable loss of historic fabric which is harmful to the significance of the Mill building as a building of architectural and historic interest, a grade II listed building. It is therefore considered contrary to advice given in section 12 of the NPPF and policy HE.14 of the WDLPR and policy CP20 of the LPP1.

- 3. The proposal results in an over-domestication of the setting of the listed building which is to the detriment of the understanding of the building's original form and function. It is therefore considered contrary to the advice given in section 12 of the NPPF and policy HE.14 of the WDLPR policy CP20 of the LPP1.
- 4. There is insufficient private and general amenity space for the proposed apartments contrary to policy DP5 of the WDLPR.

# Informatives:

The Local Planning Authority has taken account of the following development plan policies and proposals:-

Winchester District Local Plan Review 2006: DP3, DP4, DP5, HE5, HE6, HE7, HE8, HE14, H3, SF1, T2, T4 Local Plan Part 1: DS1, MTRA1, MTRA2, CP1, CP2, CP3, CP6, CP9, CP10, CP11, CP13, CP14, CP20, CP21

# 3. DEMOLITION OF THE POLICE CONSTABULARY BUILDING AND THE ERECTION OF THREE STOREY DETACHED BUILDING COMPRISING 15 RETIREMENT APARTMENTS; CONVERSION AND EXTENSION OF STATION MILL TO FORM 5 RETIREMENT APARTMENTS. ALTERATIONS TO ACCESSES; SURFACE AND BASEMENT LEVEL PARKING AND LANDSCAPED GROUNDS (AFFECTS THE SETTING OF A LISTED BUILDING) - FORMER HAMPSHIRE CONSTABULARY BUILDING AND STATION MILL, STATION ROAD, ALRESFORD. Case number: 14/02954/LIS

(Extract from PDC1026 Item 6 and Update Sheet dated 28 May 2015 refers)

At its meeting held on 28 May 2015, the Planning Committee agreed that the above application be referred to the Planning (Viewing) Sub-Committee for determination, to allow Members to assess the proposed developments in relation to their setting. Public participation had taken place at the meeting of the Committee held on 28 May 2015 where David Williams (Planning consultant on behalf of applicant) spoke in support. Ward Councillors Simon Cook and Jeffs had also spoken on this item.

Therefore, immediately prior to the public meeting, the Viewing Sub-Committee visited the application site where it assessed the proposed development in relation to the setting of Station Mill, the Listed Building.

Following debate, Members expressed their support for the scheme in principle, but were agreed that the impact of the proposals on the listed building at Station Mill was unacceptable and that it was possible that an

amended application could achieve an acceptable scheme. The application was therefore refused.

### **RESOLVED**:

That the decision taken on the Planning Application in relation to Former Hampshire Constabulary Building and Station Mill, Station Road, Alresford (Case number: 14/02954/LIS refers), be refused for the following reasons as set out in Report PDC1026 and in the Update Sheet dated 28 May 2015.

### **Reasons:**

The proposal, by way of extension to the historic Mill building is considered to be over dominant in form, scale and massing and requires considerable loss of historic fabric which is harmful to the significance of the Mill building as a building of architectural and historic interest, a grade II listed building. It is therefore considered contrary to advice given in section 12 of the NPPF and policy HE.14 of the WDLPR and policy CP20 of the LPP1.

## Informatives:

The Local Planning Authority has taken account of the following development plan policies and proposals:-

Winchester District Local Plan Review 2006: DP3, DP4, DP5, HE5, HE6, HE7, HE8, HE.14, H3, SF1, T2, T4 Local Plan Part 1: DS1, MTRA1, MTRA2, CP1, CP2, CP3, CP6, CP9, CP10, CP11, CP13, CP14, CP20, CP21

The meeting commenced at 11.00am and concluded at 11.20am

Chairman