

THE OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE – ADDITIONAL MEETING

Thursday, 13 December 2018

Attendance:

Councillors
Learney (Chairman)

Stallard
Cunningham
Gemmell
McLean

Thompson
Tod
Lumby

Deputy Members:

Councillor Berry (as deputy for Weston) and Hiscock (as deputy for Evans)

Others in attendance who addressed the meeting:

Councillors Miller (Portfolio Holder for Estates) and Warwick (Portfolio Holder for Environment).

Others in attendance who did not address the meeting:

Councillors Bell, Godfrey (Portfolio Holder for Professional Services) and Humby (Portfolio Holder for Business Partnerships).

Apologies for Absence:

Councillors Clear, Evans and Weston

1. **DISCLOSURES OF INTERESTS**

Councillors Hiscock, Stallard and Tod all declared a personal (but not prejudicial interest) in item 5 (Station Approach Update – Presentation) due to their role as County Councillors having been involved in discussions regarding the Station Approach scheme.

2. **CHAIRMAN'S ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The Chairman announced that she had agreed for a supplementary agenda to be issued in respect of Item 6 below (Environmental Services Kerbside Glass Collection and Contract Strategy) due to its urgent consideration by the Committee prior to the additional meeting of Cabinet on 18 December 2018.

3. **TO NOTE THE SCRUTINY WORK PROGRAMME FOR 2018/19 AND THE FORWARD PLAN FOR JANUARY 2019**

The Chief Executive advised that, in respect of a query raised by a Member requesting a review of the Council's communications processes and navigation of the new website, officers would consider how to bring this forward to the Committee as part of an update on the transformation and online transaction work currently being carried out by the Strategic Director: Resources. The Chairman would discuss with officers how best to proceed in due course.

RESOLVED:

That the Scrutiny Work Programme for 2018/19 and Forward Plan for January 2019, be noted.

4. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

At the invitation of the Chairman, John Hearn (on behalf of the City of Winchester Trust) and Mark Baulch (Hampshire Chamber of Commerce and Director of the Business Improvement District) addressed the Committee with regard to Item 5 (Station Approach Presentation), as set out below:

In summary, Mr Hearn raised the following points:

- Architectural response by LDS architects had been well considered in many ways, but the opinion of the Trust was that the Council's decision to insist on car parking within the scheme was incorrect;
- The recently published Movement Strategy states that commuter traffic must be addressed with priorities to reduce City Centre traffic. Adding car parking within the scheme would not address this but encourage employees and visitors of the Carfax site to drive into the centre,
- Currently there were 16,000 daily commuter car trips into Winchester town centre from outside, resulting in 61% of all traffic;
- The Trust urged the Council to take a decision to remove car parking to tackle congestion and pollution rather than proposing 124 underground car parking spaces for employees and the public . It was suggested that if the proposed car parking was removed, the scheme would be cheaper to build as there would be no need to implement a ramp down to underground vehicular access from Gladstone Street; and
- Station Approach was the most sustainable location in Winchester with accessibility by train, park and ride buses, normal bus services and its proximity to residential areas for pedestrians and cyclists.

In summary, Mr Baulch raised the following points:

- Supports Station Approach and the vibrancy the scheme brings to the City Centre;
- Businesses are contributors to bringing wealth to the City;
- Mr Baulch considered the project would bring in extra workers and as such he supported the parking strategy the Council had put into effect and noted long term parking plans for park and ride sites, which he wished to see increased as a viable alternative for businesses; and

- Mr Baulch advised he had no opinion in relation to the parking on site. However, he stated that other city locations had provided Grade A offices with car parking on site and this reaped the most advantageous rents.

5. **STATION APPROACH DEVELOPMENT UPDATE - PRESENTATION**
(Presentation)

Councillor Miller introduced the presentation provided by the Head of Programme which set out an update on the economic proposals and approach taken for the Station Approach project to date.

The Head of Programme highlighted the following key points within the presentation and answered Members' questions thereon:

- 140k sqft of Grade A office space would support retail and gateway public realm improvements contributing to the delivery of the Council Strategy and its vision for Winchester to become a premier business location by creating significant high value employment opportunities;
- Grant Thornton commissioned to carry out the economic case appraisal to quantify the benefits of the proposal (gross and net) in comparison to the assumed costs;
- Analysis of the Local Economy, with the Winchester District ranking in the top 40 nationally for with Gross Value Added (GVA) per job value and also scoring positively in respect of key industries, business demography, office floor space, catchment areas and skills.
- A summary of GVA and Jobs: Estimated direct and indirect jobs created expected to total 1,357 as part of the scheme resulting in a significant total of £81m GVA;
- Social Impacts including: salary uplifts, construction employment and GVA benefits, new employment opportunities for the local community and wider regeneration analysis;
- Comparisons to the 2016 scheme;
- Conclusions and next steps of the project over the coming months leading towards the progression of the scheme in Spring/Summer 2019, in accordance with the decisions taken at the RIBA Stage gateways.

In response to several questions regarding the need and demand for the provision of car parking on site and associated costs, utilisation of the surrounding public transport links given the scheme's locality nearby to the train station, and the impact of Brexit on construction costs etc, the Head of Programme clarified that car parking within the scheme was considered influential on rental levels.. It was noted that risks associated with Brexit remained uncertain but that a contingency had been incorporated within the cost plan for the scheme and possible conditions that could arise from Brexit were identified in the risk register which would continue to be monitored at each gateway stage going forward, whilst having due regard to the consultants advice.

It was confirmed that there was evidence that competing Grade A office developments had included car parking for employees and visitors within their schemes. However, during progression of the project, options on this element would be considered further and brought forward within the business case.

In conclusion, the Committee welcomed the project, the work carried out by officers to date and thanked the Portfolio Holder for Estates and the Head of Programme for his informative presentation.

RESOLVED:

That the presentation be received and noted.

6. **ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES KERBSIDE GLASS COLLECTION AND CONTRACT STRATEGY (CAB3108) (LESS EXEMPT APPENDICES)**
(Report CAB3108 refers)

The Committee noted that Report CAB3108 had not been notified for inclusion on the agenda within the statutory deadline. The Chairman agreed to accept the item onto the agenda as a matter requiring urgent consideration to ensure the Committee could consider the report in advance of the additional meeting of Cabinet on 18 December 2018.

The Chairman welcomed to the meeting, Vicky Beechey, Project Integra, who provided a detailed presentation setting out the Government's national updates regarding resources and waste in relation to the following matters and answered Members' questions thereon:

- EU Circular Economy Package;
- DEFRA Resources and Waste Strategy;
- Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR); and
- Deposit Return Scheme (DRS)

It was noted that Project Integra worked in partnership with local councils across Hampshire. Reference was made to the recent waste analysis work and to a number of key points in respect of what would be coming forward as National Policy including:

- Recycling targets for municipal waste up to 2035;
- Kerbside sort/source recycling of bio-waste;
- The five pillars of the waste strategy by modifying the life cycle of products from the materials used at manufacturing stage; to processes taken during consumer use and disposal; to the end of life at waste management stage with the treatment/reprocessing of the product;
- Increasing the use of DRS to assist with reducing litter and increasing recycling;
- Consultations – this included three national consultations regarding EPR, DRS and Consistency and Metrics due to be undertaken by DEFRA and also a consultation on single use plastics; and
- The outcome of Waste Composition Analysis.

In respect of the consultations carried out by DEFRA, it was reported that Project Integra would respond accordingly on behalf of all local authorities within Hampshire. This process would take place in January 2019 and would run for a period of 12 weeks. It was noted that the Strategy Review, Consultation

Responses and Hampshire Waste Partnership (HWP)/PI programme progression were all expected during Summer 2019

In response to the presentation, Members raised a number of questions in relation to the following points which were answered accordingly: the disposal of food waste going forward; life cycle cost of packaging and collection incentives, glass collections and materials to be used; manufacturing of plastics and packaging, clearer uniformed labelling for recyclables, the recycling of batteries and collection arrangements. In response, Ms Beechey clarified that all comments received would be addressed and would feed into the consultation process going forward.

In conclusion, the Committee welcomed and supported the work taking place, recognised that this would drive significant environmental change for Hampshire and that the Hampshire Waste Partnership would have a fundamental role going forward.

The Chairman thanked Ms Beechey for attending the meeting and providing a very informative presentation.

Councillor Warwick introduced the report which set out a number of proposals to Cabinet for consideration at its meeting on 18 December 2018 in respect of the procurement of waste collection services across the District, in particular a one year extension of the current contract with a number of priced options for consideration. In addition, the report also set out details of how a new service for the collection of glass at the kerbside could be introduced to residents from October 2019.

The Chairman welcomed representatives from White Young Green (WYG), the Council's external advisors for the contract, to the meeting to assist with any matters that could arise during consideration of the report.

Councillor Warwick highlighted that the one year contract extension put the Council in the mid-point in terms of cost, and allowed the Council to lease newer vehicles with lower 'Euro 6' emission engines to improve collection reliability and reduce carbon emissions. A dedicated contract management team would be established in Winchester to improve the efficiency of the service to residents locally. Councillor Warwick clarified that East Hampshire District Council had delegated provision of the service to Havant Borough Council.

In addition, the one year extension would provide an opportunity for the Council to address any forthcoming changes expected from DEFRA which could impact on the service design.

During questions and debate, the Committee raised a number of questions on the following which were responded to by the relevant Officers, the Council's external advisors from WYG and/or Portfolio Holders present:

- (i) Review of the number of 'bring' sites - The Strategic Director confirmed that the number of bring sites would reduce by 20 but that all residents would have access to kerbside glass collection. A review of the sites

- would be carried out to evaluate usage. WYG representatives reported that service had been carefully modelled, looking at the patterns of usage and kerbside glass collection services used elsewhere;
- (ii) The need to introduce food waste recycling as soon as possible, following the Government's announcement of the new waste strategy as set out in paragraph 2.8 of the report – it was confirmed that this matter was open for Members to review as part of the scope;
 - (iii) The efficiency and reliability of the existing fleet of vehicles;
 - (iv) One year extension costs within the Medium Tern Financial Strategy (MTFS). The Strategic Director: Resources clarified that a mid-cost for the one year extension of the contract had been incorporated in the MTFS, but the full cost of this would be dependant on which option was agreed. The Strategic Director reminded the Committee that the pricing provided was based on a one year contract and that with competition in the market for the longer term, this price would be reviewed in order to continue to achieve the best value and position for the Council; and
 - (v) Customer service enquiries and complaints – The Strategic Director clarified that with the introduction for a new contract, new methods would be implemented for customer contact, including new reporting applications, IT systems and improved performance data monitoring.

The Committee agreed to the following recommendations in principle before moving to exempt session to discuss the matters contained within the exempt appendices to the report.

RESOLVED:

1. That the Portfolio Holder notes the comments of the Committee; and
2. That the Cabinet be asked to give further consideration to the proposed choice of pricing proposal (detail in exempt minute)

7. **EXEMPT BUSINESS:**

RESOLVED:

1. That in all the circumstances, the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public interest in disclosing the information.
2. That the public be excluded from the meeting during the consideration of the following items of business because it is likely that, if members of the public were present, there would be disclosure to them of 'exempt information' as defined by Section 100I and Schedule 12A to the Local Government Act 1972.

<u>Minute Number</u>	<u>Item</u>	<u>Description of Exempt Information</u>
--------------------------	-------------	--

9	Environmental Services Kerbside Glass Collection and Contract Strategy (exempt appendices))))))))	Information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (including the authority holding that information). (Para 3 Schedule 12A refers)
---	--	---------------------------------	--

8. **ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES KERBSIDE GLASS COLLECTION AND CONTRACT STRATEGY (EXEMPT APPENDICES)**
(Report CAB3108 refers)

The Committee considered the contents of the exempt appendices to the report which included commercially sensitive information regarding the proposed contract extension, in addition to legal advice (detail in exempt minute).

The meeting commenced at 6.30 pm and concluded at 9.30 pm

Chairman