

## **PLANNING COMMITTEE**

**20 June 2019**

Attendance:

Councillors  
Evans (Chair)

Rutter  
Bronk  
Clear  
Laming

McLean  
Read  
Ruffell

Deputy Members:

Councillor Pearson

Others in attendance who addressed the meeting:

Councillors Achwal, Craske and Porter

Others in attendance who did not address the meeting:

Councillor Weir

Apologies for Absence:

Councillors Cunningham

---

### 1. **DISCLOSURES OF INTERESTS**

Councillors Clear and Evans both declared a personal (but not prejudicial) interest in respect of Item 11 (Land rear of Horseshoe Paddocks, Laveys Lane, Titchfield) as they were both members of Wickham Parish Council that had considered the application, but they had taken no part in the Parish's decision and they took part in the discussion and voted thereon.

Councillor Bronk declared a personal (but not prejudicial) interest in respect of Item 7 (Land adjacent to Brookfield, Hazeley Road, Twyford) as he was a member of Colden Common and Twyford Parish Council that had considered the application and was also a Ward Councillor. He knew one of the objectors and had also met an objector and had explained the process of the Planning Committee to them but he had not discussed the application itself and he took part in the discussion and voted thereon.

In respect of Item 17 (Land off Burnet Lane, Kings Worthy) Councillor Rutter stated that she had predetermined the application. Councillor Rutter stepped down from the Committee for this item and addressed the Committee as a Ward Member and did not vote on this item.

Councillor Pearson declared a personal (but not prejudicial) interest in respect of Item 8 (Windmill Down Farm, Hambledon) and also in respect of item 13 (land adjacent to Gravel Hill, Shirrell Heath) and he participated in the discussion and voted thereon.

Councillor Ruffell declared a personal (but not prejudicial) interest in respect of Item 7 (Land adjacent to Brookfield, Hazeley Road, Twyford) as he knew the applicant from visiting his shop and he took part in the discussion and voted thereon.

2. **MINUTES**

RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the meeting held on 23 May 2019, be approved and adopted.

3. **PLANNING APPLICATIONS - SDNP ITEMS 7 - 10 AND WCC ITEMS 11 - 13 (PDC1137)**

A copy of each planning application decision is available to view on the Council's website under the respective planning application.

The Committee agreed to receive the Update Sheet as an addendum to Report PDC1137.

4. **BROOKFIELD, HAZELEY ROAD, TWYFORD, WINCHESTER (CASE NO. SDNP 01426 FUL)**

Item 7: (Land Adjacent to Brookfield) Two new two bedroom semi-detached dwellings.

Brookfield, Hazeley Road, Twyford, Winchester

Case number: SDNP/19/01426/FUL

The Service Lead Built Environment referred Members to the Update Sheet which set out in full comments and a condition (additional condition 13) that had been received from Hampshire County Council as Highway Authority. The Highway Authority had raised no objection subject to an additional condition relating to parking provision to ensure adequate onsite car parking provision for the approved development. In addition, the meeting was informed that the South Downs National Park Authority Local Plan would come into effect from 7 July 2019 and could now be given significant weight in consideration of National Park applications.

During public participation, June Kalb spoke in objection to the application and Jeff Potter (agent) and Richard Sellars (applicant) spoke in support of the application and all answered Members' questions thereon.

At the conclusion of debate, the Committee agreed to grant permission for the reasons and subject to the conditions and informatives set out in the Report and the Update Sheet.

5. **WINDMILL DOWN FARM, HAMBLEDON (CASE NO. SDNP/19/01778/FUL)**

Item 8: Replacement machinery store and workshop building.  
Windmill Down Farm, Church Lane, Hambledon  
Case number: SDNP/19/01778/FUL

The Service Lead Built Environment referred Members to the Update Sheet which set out an amendment to Condition 4 that the use of the buildings should be restricted to the storage of agricultural produce and equipment.

During public participation, David Griffiths and Caroline Dibden (Hambledon Parish Council) spoke in objection and Richard Goodall (agent) spoke in support of the application and all answered Members' questions thereon.

At the conclusion of debate, the Committee agreed to grant permission for the reasons and subject to the conditions and informatives set out in the Report and the Update Sheet subject to the inclusion of an additional condition relating to the submission of details to control light spillage from the roof lights to accord with the South Downs National Park Authority policy relating to Dark Night Skies.

6. **IVY COTTAGE, AVINGTON ROAD, AVINGTON (CASE NO. SDNP 06579 HOUS))**

Item 9: (Amended Plans) Extension to the rear of the site  
Ivy Cottage, Avington Road, Avington  
Case number: SDNP/18/06579/HOUS

During public participation, Mr Appleby (Chair of Itchen Valley Parish Council) and Hugh Thomas (agent) spoke in support of the application and all answered Members' questions thereon.

At the conclusion of debate, the Committee agreed to refuse permission for the reasons and informatives set out in the Report.

7. **IVY COTTAGE, AVINGTON ROAD, AVINGTON (CASE NO. SDNP 06580 LIS)**

Item 10: (Amended Plans) Extension to the rear of the site  
Ivy Cottage, Avington Road, Avington  
Case number: SDNP/18/06580/LIS

At the conclusion of debate, the Committee agreed to refuse permission for the reasons and informatives set out in the Report.

8. **LAND REAR OF HORSESHOE PADDOCKS BUSINESS CENTRE, LAVEYS LANE, TITCHFIELD (CASE NO. 18/01666/FUL)**

Item 11: Proposed creation of a new vehicular access via Fontley Road;  
retention of existing field access track; replacement of existing dilapidated  
footbridge and improvements to public footpath.  
Land Rear Of Horseshoe Paddocks Business Centre, Laveys Lane, Titchfield.

Case number: 18/01666/FUL

The Service Lead Built Environment referred Members to the Update Sheet which set out further comments from Wickham Parish Council.

During public participation, Robert Tutton (agent) spoke in support of the application and answered Members' questions thereon.

At the conclusion of debate, the Committee agreed to grant permission for the reasons and subject to the conditions and informatives set out in the Report and the Update Sheet.

9. **LAND ADJACENT LODGE GREEN, WHITELEY LANE, TITCHFIELD (CASE NO. 19/00426/FUL)**

Item 12: Erection of two detached 5 bedroom houses with detached garages. Land Adjacent Lodge Green, Whiteley Lane, Titchfield  
Case number: 19/00426/FUL

The Service Lead Built Environment verbally informed the meeting of an additional reason for refusal that the proposed house sizes did not accord with policy CP2 of the Winchester District Local Plan Part 1 relating to housing mix.

During public participation, Paul Crowley spoke in objection to the application and Bryan Jezeph, and Peter Knight spoke in support of the application and all answered Members' questions thereon.

During public participation, Councillor Achwal spoke on this item as Ward Member.

In summary, Councillor Achwal raised the point that this was the seventh application on the site and she supported the reasons for refusal as the site was within the strategic gap.

At the conclusion of debate, the Committee agreed to refuse permission for the reasons set out in the Report subject to the inclusion of an additional reason for refusal that the houses sizes did not accord with policy CP2 of the Winchester District Local Plan Part 1 relating to housing mix.

10. **LAND ADJACENT TO GRAVEL HILL, SHIRRELL HEATH (CASE NO. 17/02213/FUL)**

Item 13: Variation of Conditions 01 and 02 of 16/00456/FUL to make the temporary permission permanent and to amend the site layout  
Land Adjacent To Gravel Hill, Shirrell Heath  
Case number: 17/02213/FUL

The Service Lead Built Environment referred Members to the Update Sheet which set out the removal of a condition from the original 2016 application as the revised site layout could accommodate the standard static and touring caravans which were associated with traveller pitches and also the amendment of

condition 8 to remove reference to the acoustic fence which was not now considered necessary.

During public participation, Dr Angus Murdoch (agent) spoke in support of the application and answered Members' questions thereon.

During public participation, Councillor Achwal spoke on this item as a Ward Member.

In summary, Councillor Achwal raised the following points:

- Councillor Bentote (Ward Member) had also made representation by email.
- The site had a temporary permission which expired in February 2019 and it should have been vacated.
- It was in the strategic (local) gap and in the countryside.
- It was asked if the payment towards the Solent Recreation Mitigation Partnership been paid, and was it a one off payment or an annual payment.
- There were alternative traveller sites in the area that had spaces, including one in Whiteley.
- There were objections from Shedfield Parish Council and local residents and the application should be refused.

In response, the case officer confirmed that the payment to the Solent Recreation Mitigation Partnership was a one-off contribution requested at the time of consent.

At the conclusion of debate, the Committee agreed to grant permission for the reasons and subject to the conditions and informatives set out in the Report and the Update sheet.

11. **49 STONEY LANE, WINCHESTER (CASE NO. 19/00645/FUL)**

Item 15: Proposed development of 4 x 3 bed semi-detached houses and 4 x 2 bed apartments following removal of existing dwelling.  
49 Stoney Lane, Winchester.  
Case number: 19/00645/FUL.

During public participation, Keith Adams spoke in objection to the application and Wendy Croxford and Ian Tait (agent) spoke in support of the application and answered Members' questions thereon.

During public participation, Councillor Craske spoke on this item as Ward Member.

In summary, Councillor Craske raised the following points:

- It was a critical application on a sensitive plot with largely chalet bungalows in the vicinity and could set a precedent;
- Highways, urban design and ecology objected;
- Pre application guidance should have been sought by the applicant, and it increased the risk to the applicant by not doing so;

- The reasons for refusal and their supporting policies were supported;
- St Thomas More Place (on Stoney Lane) had been progressed through consultation; was better designed and did not set a precedent.

At the conclusion of debate, the Committee agreed to refuse permission for the reasons and informatives set out in the Report.

12. **7-9 GORDON AVENUE, WINCHESTER (CASE NO. 19/00577/FUL)**

Item 16: Retrospective alterations/amendments connected to the approved scheme 16/00258/FUL;

- additional living area formed within the roof space serving units 4 and 5
- additional lightwell serving unit 2
- small window infilled serving unit 3 on the west elevation
- minor landscape alterations
- revised bin/cycle storage

7-9 Gordon Avenue, Winchester

Case number: 19/00577/FUL

During public participation, Amrik Chahi (agent) spoke in support of the application and answered Members' questions thereon.

At the conclusion of debate, the Committee agreed to grant permission for the reasons and subject to the conditions and informatives set out in the Report.

13. **LAND OFF BURNET LANE, KINGS WORTHY (CASE NO. 19/00048/FUL)**

Item 17: (AMENDED PLANS 24.04.2019) A development of 35 units, including infrastructure and the open space provision associated with the development area. Provision of remaining open space, (change of use from agricultural, to publicly accessible recreation land). Diversion of Public Right of Way (ROW/3189777), in addition to a minor diversion of one of the three claimed Rights of Way.

Land off Burnet Lane, Kings Worthy

Case number: 19/00048/FUL

The Service Lead Built Environment referred Members to the Update Sheet which set out an update to the Natural England section relating to the deterioration of the water environment and the conclusion of the agreement with Habitats Regulation Assessment (HRA) - the mitigation required was covered by the Construction Management Plan and the HRA. Further, additional conditions were proposed relating to the maintaining of open space; to improve the appearance of the site in the interests of visual amenity and to ensure that the roads were constructed to a standard which had the potential to be adopted.

During public participation, Ian Gordon (Kings Worthy Parish Council) and Leane Smith (agent) spoke in support of the application and answered Members' questions thereon.

During public participation, Councillors Porter and Rutter spoke on this item as Ward Members.

In summary, Councillor Porter raised the following points:

- There had been considerable work to achieve a scheme which was best for residents both new and old;
- The highway needed to be constructed to adoptable standards;
- Traffic impact could be reduced by the new footpaths;
- The planning permission needed to be clear that the open space would be protected from future development.

In summary, Councillor Rutter raised the following points:

- That it should be conditioned that the public open space would be protected in perpetuity;
- That there should be wider consultation on the future use of the public open space, for example for wildflowers, use by dogs, inclusion of a kick-a-bout area;
- A surfaced path by Kim Bishops Walk was vital to provide safe, level access to amenities;
- Thanks to all organisations involved for providing social housing and public open space.

At the conclusion of debate, the Committee agreed to grant permission for the reasons and subject to the legal agreement (relating to the public open space), conditions and informatives set out in the Report and the Update Sheet, subject to condition 23 to be updated for legislation date and that in the Update Sheet the condition relating to improving the appearance of the site in the interests of visual amenity be further amended that the development be undertaken in accordance with approved details.

14. **WOODLEA, 3 BOYNE MEAD ROAD, KINGS WORTHY (CASE NO. 19/00189/HOU)**

Item 18: Proposed loft conversion with associated front, rear and side dormers; rear balcony; side and rear decking, fencing and terrace;  
Retrospective: Conversion of garage into studio, with small front extension  
Woodlea, 3 Boyne Mead Road, Kings Worthy  
Case number: 19/00189/HOU

The Service Lead Built Environment stated that the application included the extension to the front of the garage and not for the conversion of the garage, which had been dealt with in a previous application.

During public participation, Ian Gordon (Kings Worthy Parish Council) spoke in objection to the application and Penny Attwood (applicant) spoke in support of the application and both answered Members' questions thereon.

At the conclusion of debate, the Committee agreed to refuse permission for the reasons and informatives set out in the Report.

RESOLVED:

That the decisions taken on the Planning Applications in relation to those applications inside and outside the area of the South Downs National Park be agreed as set out in the decision relating to each item, subject to the following:

- (i) That in respect of item 8 (Windmill Down Farm, Hambledon) permission be granted for the reasons and subject to the conditions and informatives set out in the Report and the Update Sheet subject to the inclusion of an additional condition relating to the submission of details to control light spillage from the roof lights to accord with the South Downs National Park Authority policy relating to Dark Night Skies.
- (ii) That in respect of item 11 (Land rear of Horseshoe Paddocks, Laveys lane, Titchfield) permission be granted for the reasons and subject to the conditions and informatives set out in the Report and the Update Sheet
- (iii) That in respect of item 12 (land adjacent Lodge Green Whiteley), permission be refused for the reasons set out in the Report subject to the inclusion of an additional reason for refusal that the houses sizes did not accord with policy CP2 of the Winchester District Local Plan Part 1 relating to housing mix.
- (iv) That in respect of item 17 (Land off Burnet lane, Kings Worthy) permission be granted for the reasons and subject to the legal agreement (relating to the public open space), conditions and informatives set out in the Report and the Update Sheet, subject to condition 23 to be updated for legislation date and that in the Update Sheet the condition relating to improve the appearance of the site in the interests of visual amenity be further amended that the development be undertaken in accordance with approved details.

15. **CONFIRMATION OF TREE PRESERVATION ORDER TPO2253 - 2 BEREWEEKE AVENUE (PDC1133)**

During public participation, Sarah Garabette spoke on this item in objection to the confirmation of the TPO.

RESOLVED:

That, having taken into consideration the representations received, Tree Preservation Order 2253 be confirmed.

16. **CONFIRMATION OF TREE PRESERVATION ORDER TPO2252 - 35 DEAN LANE, WINCHESTER (PDC1138)**

During public participation, Mr Walker spoke on this item in objection to the confirmation of the TPO and Councillor Craske spoke on this item as Ward Member.



In summary, Councillor Craske raised the following points:

- The beech trees added character to the area;
- The trees had high amenity value and supported wildlife and reduced CO2;
- Policy CP20 was relevant and the trees also helped conserve the local distinctiveness of St Barnabas in accordance with its design statement;
- The trees contributed to the setting and should be retained.

RESOLVED:

That, having taken into consideration the representations received, Tree Preservation Order 2252 be confirmed.

The meeting commenced at 9.30am, adjourned between 12.50pm and 2.00pm and concluded at 4.20pm.

Chair